One may welcome and recommend the reasoned arguments of Tenney's prolegomenon without going along with his musical analyses, drawn from Ives, Ruggles, Schoenberg, Webern, and Varèse. To analyze clangs and sequences in a score (as distinct from a hearing) is to decide on performance articulations, relative weight and direction, and minute differentiations in volume and attack—what was once called "phrasing." One performer's clang may be another performer's element. Tenney's three clangs in the twenty-third measure of Opus 11 No. 3 make "choppy" music to my way of thinking Schoenberg's long Brahmsian phrases in this movement, and measure 23 I see as part of a $2\frac{1}{2}$-measure polyphonic sequence with differentiations of pitch-range requiring the most careful differentiations of "touch" between the pianist's hands.

The longest illustration, to which Tenney gives four pages of discussion, is a complex polyphonic passage from "Emerson," the second and third systems of page 3 of the Arrow score of Ives's *Concord Sonata* through the entrance of the Fifth Symphony motive on system four. All his parametric profiles do not lead him to correcting the misprint in the score. The first left hand A in the lowest stave of system 2 should be A-flat: by similarity with the five preceding repetitions of this "clang" in the right hand and by the fusty observation that the harmonic sense of the whole passage is "dominant-minor-ninth to tonic" stated twice in C and four times in B-flat.

JOHN R. WHITE is professor of music at Indiana University, director of the University Collegium Musicum, and harpsichordist with the Baroque Chamber Players. He has published an edition of the tablature of Johannes of Lublin and the complete keyboard works of Michelangelo Rossi.

Hannes Reimann
Die Einführung des Kirchengesangs in der Zürcher Kirche nach der Reformation

Zürich: Zwingli-Verlag, 1959, 127p.

Elwyn A. Wienandt

A dissertation that undertakes an examination of what seems to be only a local development, one that has been copiously examined in the past, would seem to be another example of an author beating a dead horse. In this instance, however, we are treated to the results of a thorough re-appraisal of the events culminating in the restoration of organized singing to the religious service in Zurich. Reimann reviews the literature that has accumulated over a period of nearly a century, adds the results of his investigation of manuscripts from Winterthur and Zurich, and evaluates the matter anew with a fresh approach to the influence of Raphael Egli on the development of the reinstated musical practice.

Huldrych (Ulrich) Zwingli (d. 1531) completely divested the religious service in Zurich of its liturgical components except for the quarterly observance of the Lord's Supper, removed the ornament of congregational music from worship by destroying the cathedral organ, and in 1525 took away the choirbooks from the church so that choral singing was also effectively stilled.

Reimann traces the efforts to justify singing in the church between that date and 1598. A decade after Zwingli's death there is evidence of school children singing on the major holidays, but not until 1571 does a document outline a procedure that calls for their regular appearance in church to perform psalms and other religious songs. However, as early as 1533 there were songbooks in print, some of them going into several editions, indicating a wide acceptance of the songs. Their appearance continued to be marked by theological dispute over their suitability, most of the argument revolving around a few passages of Scripture. It is taken for granted that the reader recognizes the unique position of Zurich in relation to church music and knows that the situation in Bern, Basel, Constance, and other places was markedly different.

Reimann's most significant contribution lies in a careful analysis of the place held by Raphael Egli (1559–1622) in the reorganization of Zurich's musical practice. Earlier writers have tended to overemphasize Egli's importance, but Reimann brings new sources to bear in placing him as one of a group of important figures. Egli was familiar with the practice of psalm singing in Geneva as well as with the Genevan Psalter itself. He was, in fact, a student of Theodore Beza during his years in Geneva. In 1588 he went to Zurich where he achieved considerable prominence, and it was there that he wrote the *Bericht vom Kirchengesang* in 1597 (printed in full by Reimann as an appendix), in which he stressed the desirability of congregational participation in the singing, basing his argument partly on the passage in Colossians 3:16: "Let the word of Christ dwell in you richly in all wisdom; teaching and admonishing one another in psalms and hymns and spiritual songs, singing with grace in your hearts to the Lord." An inevitable controversy arose over the proper interpretation of the phrase "in your hearts," but the case for audible praise eventually carried the day.

The year 1598 is of signal importance to the Zurich musical practice. It marks the appearance of another important document on singing, of the first official songbook, and of the first musical service, probably with monophonic singing and certainly without the help of an organ. The document is that of Hans Jakob Murer, who again questioned the propriety of congregational singing and answered his own question with three requirements for an acceptable type of music:

1. The songs must be neither too long nor too short, and they must not encroach on the sermon (*Predigt* sometimes denoted the entire service, so the meaning here is open to more than one interpretation.)
2. They must be in the vernacular, so that all may understand them.
3. The melodies must be simple, reflecting the speech-song of the early Church which distinguished little between reading and singing.

The songbook, *Kirchengesang der gemeinen und gebreüchlichen psalmen, festgesangen und geistlichen liederen, nach der teütschen melodey für die kirchen Zürych getruckt*, contains more than a hundred pieces, among them psalm settings and seasonal chorales, most of them with the music printed as well as the text. None of the melodies is described by Reimann.

There was no direct prototype for the service that performed on Pentecost of that year, so its musical content was probably that which could have been added without interfering with the established form of the service. It cannot be said whether the new songbook was available as early as June 4, the date of Pentecost that year. Reimann speculates that, lacking the book, the children would have been called upon to sing from other available books. He includes also an Order of Service from 1563, assuming the possibility that it was still in use at the later date.

It is unfortunate that a work of this scope contains not a single note of music. The discussion is aimed at procedures and customs, but it is impossible to consider these thoroughly without reference to the music itself. A good piece of work is limited by the absence of more detailed musical discussion.

ELWYN A. WIENANDT is professor of musicology at Baylor University.