

current musicology

number 5/1967

AUSTIN CLARKSON EDITOR

ASSOCIATE EDITORS: Jon Appleton
Jamie Croy
Thomas Day
Michael Griffel
Walter Hilse
David Josephson
Raoul Orceyre, S.J.
Margaret Ross
Libby Rubin
Cheryl Seltzer
Robert Willis
Neal Zaslaw

Mildred Shapiro EXECUTIVE SECRETARY

ASSISTANT EDITORS: Paul Helmer
Amy Kaiser
Nancy Miller
Mary Obelkevich
William Payne
Mary Peckham
Rose Rosengard

EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS: Tom Frenkel, Anne Frothingham, Ann
Unterecker, Judith Zessis

Edward A. Lippman FACULTY ADVISOR

Copyright © 1967, Department of Music
Columbia University, New York
Printed in Great Britain

CORRESPONDING EDITORS

Domestic

* corresponding editor newly appointed for 1967-68

- | | |
|----------------------------|---|
| Sylvia Crawford | Baylor University, Waco, Texas |
| Rufus Hallmark | Boston University, Boston, Mass. |
| *Harriet Franklin | |
| Daniel L. Farber | Brandeis University, Waltham, Mass. |
| William K. Gallo | Catholic University of America, Washington, D.C. |
| David Sommerfield | City University of New York, Brooklyn College, Brooklyn, N.Y. |
| Mrs. Wade Hampton | City University of New York, City College, New York, N.Y. |
| Mrs. Bea Friedland | City University of New York, Queens College, Flushing, N.Y. |
| Rose Rosengard | Columbia University, New York, N.Y. |
| David Graham | Cornell University, Ithaca, N.Y. |
| *Edward E. Swenson | |
| Ernest HARRISS | George Peabody College for Teachers, Nashville, Tenn. |
| William T. Hopkins | Indiana University, Bloomington, Ind. |
| Eric Van Tassel | New York University, New York, N.Y. |
| John Carroll Collins | North Texas State University, Denton, Texas |
| Robert Lowry | Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio |
| Richard A. Kramer | Princeton University, Princeton, N.J. |
| Floyd G. Sumner | Rutgers, the State University of New Jersey, New Brunswick, N.J. |
| | State University of New York at Buffalo, Buffalo, N.Y. |
| Bruce Carr | |
| *Beye Fyfe | |
| William Mahar | Syracuse University, Syracuse, N.Y. |
| Claus Sadlier, Jr. | Tulane University, Newcomb College, New Orleans, La. |
| Daniel Coren | University of California, Berkeley, Calif. |
| John W. Baker | University of California, Davis, Calif. |
| Charles A. Johnson | University of California, Los Angeles, Calif. |
| Orin Moe, Jr. | University of California, Santa Barbara, Calif. |
| Bonnie J. Blackburn | University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill. |
| *Mrs. Ruth A. Solie | |
| Peter J. Hodgson | University of Colorado, Boulder, Col. |
| Mrs. Jeanne Brynie | University of Hawaii, Honolulu, Hawaii |
| *Mrs. Marion McKay | |
| Jerald C. Graue | University of Illinois, Urbana, Ill. |
| Hal Tamblin | University of Kansas, Lawrence, Kansas |
| Kathleen Chandler Adkins | University of Kentucky, Lexington, Ky. |
| John I. Schwarz, Jr. | University of Maryland, College Park, Md. |
| Mrs. Patricia Kellogg Lake | University of Miami, Miami, Fla. |
| John Planer | University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Mich. |
| *Thomas W. Warburton | |
| Mrs. Mary Ann Feldman | University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minn. |
| *Charles Sigmund | |
| Philip T. Jackson | University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, N.C. |
| *Louise Basbas | |
| *Dan Broucek | |
| Elizabeth Berry | University of Oregon, Eugene, Oregon |
| Mrs. Stephen L. Polen | University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, Pa. |
| Priscilla M. Drucker | University of Rochester, Eastman School of Music, Rochester, N.Y. |
| | University of Southern California, Los Angeles, Calif. |
| Linda Stryker | |
| Charles Echols | |

Michael Broyles University of Texas, Austin, Texas
Charles E. Koch, Jr.
Mrs. Anne Baker University of Toronto, Ontario, Canada
Mary Beth Duncan University of Washington, Seattle, Wash.
Raymond Barr University of Wisconsin, Madison, Wis.
Marie Ann Heiberg Washington University, St. Louis, Mo.
Ralph Cherubini Western Reserve University, Cleveland, Ohio
Michael D. Grace Yale University, New Haven, Conn.
***Albert Filosa**

Foreign Correspondents

Lazslo Somfai	Bartok Archives, Budapest, Hungary
Ladislav Burlas	Bratislava University, Bratislava, C.S.S.R.
Alan Brown	Cambridge University, Cambridge, England
Reinhard Gerlach	Göttingen University, Göttingen, Germany
Peter Strauss	Haile Selassie I University, Law Faculty, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
Georg Borchardt	Hamburg University, Hamburg, Germany
Reiner Kluge	Humboldt University, Berlin, Germany
Eberhard Klemm	Karl Marx University, Leipzig, Germany
Olga Miklóssy	Karlova University, Prague, C.S.S.R.
Bernd Baselt	Martin Luther University, Halle-Wittenberg, Germany
M. Witte	Münster University, Münster, Germany
J. D. Bergsagel	Oxford University, Oxford, England
Horst Heussner	Phillips University, Marburg, Germany
John C. G. Waterhouse	Queens University, Department of Extra-Mural Studies, Belfast, Ireland
Brian Jeffery	Saint Andrews University, French Department, Fife, Scotland
Axel Helmer	Svenskt Music History Archives, Stockholm, Sweden
Georgio Pestelli	Turin University, Turin, Italy
Richard Marlowe	The University, Southampton, England
Josephine M. Mason	University of Birmingham, Birmingham, England
Niels Martin Jensen	University of Copenhagen, Denmark
Winifried Kirsch	University of Frankfurt, Frankfurt, Germany
Karl-Werner Gümpel	University of Freiburg, Freiburg, Germany
Michael Tilmouth	University of Glasgow, Glasgow, Scotland
Othmar Wessely	University of Graz, Graz, Austria
Anthony Ford	University of Hull, Yorkshire, England
Rita Egger	University of Innsbruck, Innsbruck, Austria
Anna Amalie Abert	University of Kiel, Kiel, Germany
Anne-Marie Bragard	University of Liège, Liège, Belgium
Andrej Rijavec	University of Ljubljana, Ljubljana, Yugoslavia
Ian D. Bent	University of London, London, England
Theodor Göllner	University of Munich, Munich, Germany
John Steele	University of Otago, Dunedin, New Zealand
Marie Briquet	University of Paris, Paris, France
Robert Guilloux	
Willem Elders	University of Utrecht, Utrecht, Holland
J. E. Maddrell	University of York, English Department, York, England
Hans Conradin	University of Zürich, Zürich, Switzerland
Åke Berglund	Uppsala University, Uppsala, Sweden

Communications to the corresponding editors should be addressed care of the music department of the university unless otherwise noted.

PUBLISHED
UNDER THE AEGIS OF

The Music Department
COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY
New York

contents

EVENTS

- 5 Musicological method in American graduate schools, Part I
41 Reports from England
47 Announcements

ARTICLES

- RICHARD L. CROCKER 49 Musicology and the musical composition
PATRICIA CARPENTER 50 Some reflections on the shape of music
56 The musical object

Responses

- 87 LEO TREITLER
94 RUDOLF ARNHEIM
96 RUTH HALLE ROWEN
101 EDWARD T. CONE
107 BERNARD STAMBLER
112 DAVID BURROWS

REPORTS

- BRUCE CARR 117 Report from Buffalo: The third international Webern festival
JOHN H. BARON 119 Report from Leipzig: Congress of the Gesellschaft für Musikforschung

DISSERTATIONS

- ARTHUR HILLS 123 Michael Bruce Collins
The performance of coloration, sesquialtera, and hemiola (1450-1750)
MICHAEL COLLINS 128 Reply to Arthur Hills
ARNOLD SALOP 130 Donald M. Mintz
The sketches and drafts of three of Felix Mendelssohn's major works
JOHN CHALMERS 138 Mayer Joel Mandelbaum
Multiple division of the octave and the tonal resources of 19-tone temperament
MATT C. HUGHES 143 Reply to Michael Kassler
MICHAEL KASSLER 144 Reply to Matt C. Hughes
146 Dissertations from abroad

BIBLIOGRAPHIA

- GARY BERLIND 149 Griphos: an interim report
153 MLA publications