

dissertations

Ronald Cross—*Matthaeus Pipelare: a historic and stylistic study of his works*

Ann Arbor: University Microfilms (UM order no. 62-3317),
1961. (307 and 160 pp., New York University diss.)

Keith E. Mixer

This dissertation is the first major study of this highly imaginative and skillful composer of the turn of the 15th century. Dr. Cross has let Pipelare's works determine the course of the dissertation, since he feels that the problems are often related to specific compositions. Pipelare composed in nearly every musical genre of his time. Outstanding exceptions are the Passion and the frottola.

In Chapter I the biographical details are presented. After discussing the references to Pipelare to be found in theoretical works, Dr. Cross proceeds to refute the thesis, first advanced by Maldeghem, that Pipelare was born in Louvain. Pipelare's sojourn at 's Hertogenbosch is well documented, and the author draws all inferences from this that can justifiably be drawn. Evidence found in a Jena manuscript (*Chorbuch 2* of the Universitätsbibliothek) leads to the conclusion that the composer had died by the year 1512.

Chapter II is devoted to an examination of the concordances to Pipelare's compositions. As "sources" Dr. Cross has listed manuscripts, early prints, and modern prints. In Chapter III, which concerns the chanson compositions, the author roams rather far afield chronologically, but this often results in a very informative capsule study of a text motif.

The shortest chapter of the dissertation is the fourth. It is devoted to the composer's motets, one of which, *Hic est vere martyr*, survives only in a keyboard arrangement by Fridolin Sicher. The longest chapter by far is that which examines Pipelare's Mass compositions. These compositions, which tend to confirm the very close association with the Lowlands suggested by Pipelare's chansons, show a highly imaginative manipulation of preexistent material. In the *Missa Dicit Dominus: Nihil tuleritis in via* this manipulation leads to a structural unification of the Mass sections. In the later works (particularly the *Missa Mi Mi*) one finds much use of a "saturation"

technique, in which the writing is permeated with the preexistent material.

The sixth and final chapter is a recapitulatory one entitled "Summary of technical and stylistic details." Following the bibliography a musical supplement presents eight of the twenty-seven surviving compositions (four have been lost) in a modern edition. This edition follows modern transcription procedures. Dr. Cross uses a 2-1 reduction in the note values, and bars between the staves according to the so-called "Mensurstrich" principle. The supplement includes two chansons, two motets, a Credo, and three of the surviving nine Masses.

Great weight is given in this dissertation to Pipelare's manipulation of preexistent material, so that one finds this problem being covered in discussions of individual compositions, in the section on "Preexistent material," in the section on "Technical procedures involving preexistent material," and in the section on "Integration and saturation." While this element is obviously very important, the reviewer feels that the discussion might have been somewhat curtailed in favor of other stylistic elements. Dissonance practice, for example, receives very cursory treatment. Despite this, the author considers dissonance an important factor in determining the chronology of Pipelare's works.

Too often we find an emphasis on unusual practices in Pipelare's music. These, except by implication, do not tell us general characteristics of his style. On the other hand, when we are told about three "ubiquitous" elements of his style, we are given but one musical example of only one of these elements, with no references to further occurrences. (Knud Jeppesen's *The style of Palestrina and the dissonance* still serves as a model of documentation in this regard.)

Mensuration and rhythm receive rather extensive treatment. Here, however, one meets with an unfortunate inconsistency in point of reference, as, for example, in the discussion of canon, where semibreves, measures, and quarter rests are referred to on the same page. A priori assertions which remain unexplained do not guide the reader well, a case in point being the assumption of "composition *alla minima*" (i.e., the minim equaling the tactus in 02 mensuration) in section III ("Et resurrexit") of the *St. John Credo*. The author has quite correctly given, as an advantage of the "Mensurstrich" principle of barring, the possibility of indicating a conflicting mensuration by bar lines within the staff. Unfortunately this device of alternate (dotted) barring has been applied to instances of hemiola rhythms, rather than to really conflicting mensurations (which abound in Renaissance music). Since hemiola rhythms can be very adequately expressed in "Mensurstrich" barring without the use of supplementary alternate barring, it would seem useful to limit the use of the latter to genuine conflicting mensurations (such as C against C) and not to apply it to temporary shifts in rhythm.

Too often critical points are not illustrated by examples, or even by reference to the supplement. In the discussion of the chanson, *Morken ic hebe ter scolen ghelegen*, the piece is described and then compared to a piece by

Josquin Baston, four measures of which are quoted. How nice it would have been to have a pertinent passage of the Pipelare piece superimposed! In the discussion of the four-part Segovia *Agnus*, a critical point is made of the concluding device, which the author says is common to all the other movements. Unfortunately this is not provided in an example.

In certain parts of the dissertation questionable technical terminology seems to stand in the way of the lucid transmittal of information. In a discussion of imitation, the author states that Pipelare does not employ a great deal of imitation. In the following paragraph, however, we learn that certain types of imitation are "very characteristic of his style." These are "internal imitation" and "concluding imitation." A little later, we see that a section labeled "Phrase formation" really deals with the problem of melodic contour.

The musical supplement seems well and carefully done. One objection to procedure may be raised, however. Although the editor has set up a very workable critical apparatus, he insists on supplementing it by cumbersome and disturbing footnoting.

Abbreviations such as S ("Superius"), MS ("manuscript," as an adjective), and pr. ("printed") disturb a text which otherwise has a good literary flow. In the matter of translations, the author supplies the original of easily accessible works (such as Van den Borren's *La Musique en Belgique* or Fétis' *Biographie universelle*), but neglects to do the same for less accessible publications (such as Gerber's *Neues historisch-biographisches Lexikon der Tonkünstler*, not yet reprinted at the time this dissertation was written). After the number of translations from Latin and modern French and German, the reader is disappointed to find only the original of two Renaissance French texts (*Fors seulement* and *Vray dieu*), although the texts have much bearing on the music.

Finally, the style of the author leaves something to be desired in the matter of footnoting and bibliography. Under "Early prints" the *Liederbuch des Arnt von Aich* is not dated (*RISM* [1519]⁵), and, in general, references to the *Répertoire international des sources musicales* would have been very helpful (assuming that the volume *Recueils imprimés, XVI^e-XVII^e siècles*, published in 1960, was available for Dr. Cross's dissertation, dated Dec. 1961). The bibliography contains very few music listings, although the author has demonstrated in numerous footnotes that he has consulted such works. The author has consistently omitted place of publication (as well as publisher) in all book references, although scholars and librarians are often in need of such information in locating rare materials.

Dr. Cross is to be credited with several discoveries or fresh insights which contribute greatly to our knowledge of this area. Among these are the addition of three further manuscripts to Du Saar's list of sources for *Een vollic wesen*, the identification of *Liber 3* of the inventory of the Fugger music library as MS 34 of the Bayerische Staatsbibliothek in Munich, the disclosure of the unification of a Mass by the utilization of similar ending material, and the detection of Pipelare's use of the *Agnus Dei* of a Mass to sum up the musical

ideas which have been presented in the whole work. In general, the remarks on the organization of the polyphonic Mass are well taken.

This dissertation is a fine and penetrating study of a significant Renaissance composer. It is a pleasure for the reviewer to point to two further fruits of Dr. Cross's research: his article, "The life and works of Matthaëus Pipelare," *Musica Disciplina*, XV: 97-114 (1963), which presents the biographical details and a list of works by genre, and his edition of the *Opera Omnia* of Pipelare (Rome: American Institute of Musicology, 1966-67, 3 vols.).

Ursula Kirkendale—*Antonio Caldara: sein Leben und seine venezianisch-römischen Oratorien*

Graz-Cologne: Hermann Böhlhaus Nachfolger, 1966. (406 pp., University of Bonn diss.)

Hermine Weigel Williams

This dissertation, presented in 1961 to the faculty of philosophy at the University of Bonn for the doctoral degree, now has been published as Volume 6 of the series, *Wiener Musikwissenschaftliche Beiträge*. In the published version, the biographical portion has been greatly expanded to include additional material, especially information contained in documents from Rome.

Antonio Caldara (1670-1736), a composer primarily of vocal music, served the Imperial Court in Vienna during the reign of the Hapsburg Emperor Charles VI. His appointment to the coveted position of Vice-Kapellmeister in 1716 brought him into a circle of composers that included Johann Joseph Fux and Francesco Conti, and it is upon the basis of his musical accomplishments at this court that his reputation rests.

Until the publication of this work, little attention was paid to Caldara's musical career before 1716. In Part I, which deals with the life of Caldara, Dr. Kirkendale not only greatly expands our knowledge of his early life but corrects many errors of fact that appear in the article, "Caldara," in *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart*.

The biographical narrative begins with confirmation of the fact that Caldara, son of the violinist, Giuseppe Caldara, was indeed from Venice, for it was at San Marco that he began his musical career as one of the boy singers for the ducal chapel. What talent he possessed as a singer must have soon been overshadowed by his instrumental skill, because by 1689 he was referred to as a virtuoso cellist. With whom he studied (Kirkendale suggests Domenico Gabrielli, the famous cellist), and whether or not he was ever a regular member of an orchestra for a theater or a church is not known. In fact, up to the end of the seventeenth century, Caldara held no influential position as either a performer or composer.