

would also have been interesting. As the study stands, there is no consideration of any given antiphon as a musico-liturgical entity.

In summation, Dr. Bailey treats the ceremonies of the processions of the Sarum rite very well. The treatment of the ceremonies of the whole Western church, though more cursory, is still useful. However, the discussion of the chants provides only a tantalizing introduction to a very large and interesting repertory.

Jay Weldon Wilkey—*Certain Aspects of Form in the Vocal Music of Alban Berg*

Ann Arbor: University Microfilms (UM order no. 65-10,911, 1965.
281 pp., Indiana University diss.)

Fred Hauptman

The music of Alban Berg presents an unusual challenge to the analyst. Berg's eclecticism and stylistic freedom prevent a totally systematic approach and lead writers to unfounded generalizations. Most of the writing on Berg is by authors who are not theoreticians, and real weaknesses in the older analyses have been exposed by recent critical works, such as that of George Perle. Therefore, extended theoretical studies, such as that undertaken in this dissertation, are necessary if the elements of Berg's expressive but elusive style are to be finally clarified.

The purpose of the study is "to trace the development of two formal phenomena in the vocal music of Alban Berg, namely his use of serial technique and his use of traditional forms" (p. iii). Dr. Wilkey examines all of Berg's published music with voice, including *Der Wein* and the two operas. After introductory chapters on the Schoenberg school in general and on the basically Romantic nature of Berg's early works, there are five chapters that attempt to show a clear line of serial development from the *Sieben frühe Lieder* to *Lulu*. The "phenomenon" of "traditional form" is then discussed in two chapters, one on "contrapuntal procedures," the second on "sectional forms." These are followed by a summary and bibliography.

The topics discussed in the dissertation are important ones. Indeed, each of the "aspects" chosen could profitably be the subject of a separate volume, and their alliance here seems somewhat arbitrary, causing the author to discuss most works twice in order to maintain his two-part organization. This would be a minor inconvenience to the reader if the study achieved its aims. Unfortunately, despite some insights, it leaves a great many questions unanswered.

The first chapter teaches us nothing new about the relationship of the

Schoenberg school with the past. After making the assertion that atonality (!) and serial composition were the "innovations" of Schoenberg and his followers, Dr. Wilkey states that "analogies can be seen between concentrated thematic development and serial composition" (p. 6). This is to be the main thrust of his attempt to show that the earlier works of Berg have serial tendencies.

The chapter discussing Berg's early Romanticism makes valid reference to the influences of Brahms, Schumann, and Wolf without ever being detailed enough for this type of ostensibly exhaustive study. What is there about *Schliesse mir die Augen beide* that reminds one of "Robert Schumann or a young Johannes Brahms?" In this section the author comes to grips with the question of French Impressionist influence on Berg. There are many aspects of Berg's music that seem to bear out the relationship—whole-tone melodies and harmonies, parallel chords, instrumental refinements, etc. Yet Berg apparently had little interest in French music. In his published lecture on *Wozzeck* (reprinted in Redlich's biography) Berg speaks of the "vague and bottomless sonorities" of the Impressionists. Dr. Wilkey hypothesizes that Berg was influenced instead by Franz Schrecker and refers to Berg's piano reduction of Schrecker's *Der ferne Klang* for Universal Edition, as well as the friendship of the two composers. This is an interesting idea which is left hanging, perhaps because it does not bear upon the central premises of the dissertation. Again, some specific reference to *Der ferne Klang*, a score explicitly cited by Dr. Wilkey, would have been most useful.

The analyses of Berg's early songs contained in the next chapter constitute the most valuable part of the dissertation. Each of the *Sieben frühe Lieder* and the *Vier Lieder*, Op. 2, is discussed from the point of view of motivic organization. These discussions make it amply clear that Schoenberg's principle of "continuous variation" was thoroughly applied by Berg and that Op. 2 is harmonically unified in a manner similar to that employed in many Schoenberg works, such as *Erwartung*. Errors do creep in: there is an F Minor triad in *Schilflied* (bar 17); and the opening of *Traumgekrönt* is not tonally "obscure" but clearly an elaboration of the dominant of G Minor, with an augmented-sixth impression that strengthens rather than weakens the tonal pull. However, since there has been no comparable study of these songs published, students and performers would do well to seek out Dr. Wilkey's explications of the complex motivic manipulations so characteristic of Berg.

The applicability of these analyses to the theory that the early songs show serial tendencies is less certain. The idea that motivic economy is a precursor of the twelve-tone technique inevitably leads to a tiresome search through music history for precedents of dubious relevance. On page 31 Bach and Mozart (why those two?) are cited as showing the historical roots of serial thinking, and on page 3 isorhythmic motets are marshalled as evidence. If there are any *uniquely* pre-serial devices in the early Berg songs, they are not uncovered in the dissertation. The example of "octave-displacement" found at the end of *Nacht* is irrelevant—the repetition of a

cadential figure in a different octave is hardly evidence of serial thought. The analyses of Berg's song are valuable although they do not prove Wilkey's thesis.

The fourth chapter deals with the *Altenburg Lieder*, Op. 4. In light of the availability of Leibowitz's analysis of these songs in *The Musical Quarterly* XXXIV (1948), as well as a dissertation by Mark DeVoto on Op. 4, the material in this chapter does not contribute much that is new. Dr. Wilkey admits that Leibowitz was a "great aid" to him, and, in fact, his analysis is basically an extended rewriting of the Leibowitz article. However, a few new points are made, and some of Leibowitz's errors are corrected (for example, his misreading of the final pedal chord of the fourth song). Nevertheless, Dr. Wilkey's approach is too derivative to be valuable as original work.

The chapter on *Wozzeck* is divided into three parts: thematic usage, harmonic practice, and specific serial techniques. The first two sections add little to the sum of our knowledge of the opera, but the final portion includes, among other things, a detailed study of the passacaglia in Act I, Scene 4, and a good analysis of Act III, Scene 1. There are some weaknesses—the derivation of the passacaglia theme from the harmonic series of Act I, Scene 2, is unconvincing owing to the confusion over transpositions; the top brace of Example 111 is accidentally left untransposed (it should be a minor third higher); and the note B, although absent from the actual canon beginning in bar 97 of Act III, is present as a pedal throughout its duration. Despite these flaws the chapter does succeed in throwing some new light upon a much discussed score.

Der Wein, on the other hand, has been scantily treated by writers on Berg; published analyses are limited to discussions of the formal structure and sketchy descriptions of the serial techniques. Dr. Wilkey fills this lacuna with some success, especially in providing examples of serially derived harmony. He is unfortunately prone to vagueness here, and blanket statements such as "the vocal line consists primarily of various presentations of the basic set" (p. 160) are surprising in the context of this dissertation, in which the author was most careful with the early songs. One would have hoped to find a closely worked study of melodic material in *Der Wein* as a means of uniting Berg's pre-serial and serial works. Similarly, since Dr. Wilkey is later revealed as a defender of Reich, it is curious that he does not discuss the pertinent section of the Reich book, with its printed facsimile of Berg's hand showing a different form of the row as prime (actually I_9 of the prime given by other analysts and Dr. Wilkey, himself).

Lulu is the most complex and controversial of Berg's serial compositions. Dr. Wilkey's views on the work are somewhat perplexing. In a summary of the published literature on *Lulu*, he defends Reich's statement, ostensibly derived from Berg himself, that the opera is based on a single twelve-tone row. George Perle's article in *JAMS* (1959) is exhaustively paraphrased, but Perle's argument that the secondary sets were *not* derived by the obtusely numerical means reported by Reich but chosen for "compositional" reasons

(such as partial identity or similarity with each other and the Basic Series) is apparently rejected. The second part of the chapter presents analyses of three sections of the opera: the Prologue, the closing theme of the sonata in Act I, and the "Lied der Lulu." In this section Dr. Wilkey purports to supplant Perle's "new analysis" by producing a "newer" one. However, his description of the opera's serial structure seems to be merely a combination of Reich and Perle. Reich's set derivations are faithfully followed. The sets not discussed by Reich (Athlete, Schoolboy, Casti-Piani) are derived in a similarly numerical fashion, drawing on a passage in Perle in which these three sets are derived "after the manner of Reich, for those who prefer the authorized analysis" (Perle, p. 196). The authority for all this is apparently Berg, with Reich as his mouthpiece (Dr. Wilkey thinks that Berg "perhaps forgot" about the sets omitted by Reich), yet Berg's other form of the *Der Wein* set was not mentioned.

The choice of the Prologue for analysis was unfortunate, as that section is treated in some detail by Perle (it is the only section Perle discusses fully) and there is little left for Dr. Wilkey to add. The material in the other two analyses is worthwhile in that it presents some examples of serially derived harmony in a work not noted for its strictness. The reader expecting a "newer analysis," however, will be disappointed.

The two chapters on form seem to be a sort of appendage, belying the original double purpose of the dissertation, as they consist of unconvincing attempts to connect the use of a "traditional form" with textual interpretation. The conclusions are occasionally convincing, but these chapters are serviceable only as a catalogue of forms in Berg's vocal music. As usual in the dissertation, when original analyses-in-depth are present, they are much more interesting than the contextual material. The analysis of Dr. Schoen's strophic aria in Act II of *Lulu* is a case in point.

In general, Dr. Wilkey's dissertation is weakened by its duality of purpose. Furthermore, such important questions as the use of pitch or "tonal" relations in Berg's larger forms (the sonata form in *Lulu*, for example), are virtually ignored. Nevertheless, the Berg student searching for information will find some of the analyses quite useful.