current musicology number 14/1972

COEDITORS: L. MICHAEL GRIFFEL

MARGARET ROSS GRIFFEL

SPECIAL

PROJECT EDITOR: LÉONIE ROSENSTIEL

GENERAL EDITOR: Maurie Sommer

SENIOR Emmanuel Leemans

ASSOCIATE EDITORS: D. Jay Rahn

Stephen Willis

ASSOCIATE EDITORS: Thomas W. Baker

Tamara Lowe Dworsky

Robert Fuller Bonnie Lester Jack Light

ASSISTANT EDITOR: Faye-Ellen Silverman

EDITORIAL ASSISTANTS: Anne Bagnall, Janice Butler, Peter Dedel,

Gabriel Ghirlando, S. J., Richard Koprowski,

Stephan Kotrch, Dennis Sanders, Douglass Seaton, George Stauffer

BUSINESS DEPARTMENT: Thomas W. Baker, Manager

Jack Light, Advertising

SECRETARY: Cynthia Schwan

FACULTY ADVISOR: Christoph Wolff

Copyright © 1972, The Trustees of Columbia

University in the City of New York Printed in Great Britain by William Clowes & Sons, Limited London, Beccles and Colchester

CORRESPONDING EDITORS

Domestic

Patricia T. Nolan Boston University, Boston, Mass. Alexander Silbiger Brandeis University, Waltham, Mass. Harriet Franklin Brown University, Providence, R.I. Myrl Hermann Bryn Mawr College, Bryn Mawr, Pa. Harrison M. Schlee Carnegie-Mellon University, Pittsburgh, Pa. Jurgen Thyme Case Western Reserve University, Cleveland, Ohio Robert E. Houston Catholic University of America, Washington, D.C. Adrienne F. Block City University of New York, New York, N.Y. Anne Gugliotta City University of New York, Brooklyn College, Brooklyn, N.Y. Rita Mead City University of New York, Hunter College, New York, N.Y. Anita Heppner City University of New York, Queens College, Flushing, N.Y. Jack Light Columbia University, New York, N.Y. Laurel Fav Cornell University, Ithaca, N.Y. Carole K. Huston Florida State University, Tallahassee, Fla. Thomas Kelly Harvard University, Cambridge, Mass. James C. Griesheimer Indiana University, Bloomington, Ind. Andrea Olmstead Juilliard School, New York, N.Y. Samuel O. Douglas Louisiana State University, Baton Rouge, La. Manhattan School of Music, New York, N.Y. Marek Sowinski Dale Hunter McGill University, Montreal, Quebec, Canada William Penn Michigan State University, East Lansing, Mich. Barbara Petersen New York University, New York, N.Y. Norman Rubin Princeton University, Princeton, N.J. John D. Arnn Rutgers University, New Brunswick, N.J. Kathleen Chaikin Stanford University, Stanford, Calif. Michael A. Keller State University of New York at Buffalo, Buffalo, N.Y. Tulane University, Newcomb College, New Orleans, La. Thomas N. Rushing Philip E. Aaholm University of Arizona, Tucson, Ariz. University of Arkansas, Fayetteville, Ark. Mary Ann Grigsby University of California, Berkeley, Calif. Richard Evidon University of California, Davis, Calif. Sue Vinks Hough James H. Moore University of California, Los Angeles, Calif. University of California, Riverside, Calif. Rosalie Schellhous Warren Spaeth University of California, Santa Barbara, Calif. M. Elizabeth C. Bartlet University of Chicago, Chicago, Ill. University of Colorado, Boulder, Col. John H. Hajdu Anne Amerson University of Hawaii, Honolulu, Hawaii University of Illinois, Urbana, Ill. Sister Bertha Fox Gordon S. Rowley University of Iowa, Iowa City, Iowa George C. Foreman University of Kansas, Lawrence, Kan. Lee Patrick University of Kentucky, Lexington, Ky. Ramona H. Matthews University of Maryland, College Park, Md. Jack Crawford University of Miami, Coral Gables, Fla. David M. Carlson University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Mich. Janice C. Teisberg University of Minnesota, Minneapolis, Minn. Julia Ann Griffin University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill, N.C. & Dan Broucek Richard Benedum University of Oregon, Eugene, Ore. Frank Carey University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, Pa. Norris L. Stephens University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, Pa. Carol Lee Irwin University of Rochester, Eastman School of Music, Rochester, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, Calif. Robert D. Lynch

James H. Cook University of Texas, Austin, Tex.

Frederick A. Hall University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada

Paul F. Marks University of Washington, Seattle, Wash.

David Schroeder University of Western Ontario, London, Ontario, Canada

Paul D. Ledvina
Edgar J. Lewis
Thom Lipiczky
André P. Larson
West Virginia University, Morgantown, W. Va.

Western Mishigan University, Kelepaggo Mish

Arsen R. Papakhian Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, Mich.

Janet Schmalfeldt Yale University, New Haven, Conn.

Foreign

László Somfai Bartók Archives, Budapest, Hungary

Georges Franck Brussels, Belgium

Don Harran Hebrew University, Jerusalem, Israel

Jacques Chailley Institute of Music and Music Education, Paris, France

Ivo Supičić Institute of Musicology, Zagreb, Yugoslavia

Winfried Kirsch Johann Wolfgang Goethe University, Frankfurt, Germany

Othmar Wessely Karl-Franzens University, Graz, Austria

Bernd Baselt Martin Luther University, Halle-Wittenberg, Germany

Horst Heussner Phillips University, Marburg, Germany

John C. G. Waterhouse Queen's University, Department of Extra-Mural Studies,

Belfast, N. Ireland

José López-Calo Salamanca, Spain

Francis Cameron State Conservatorium of Music, Sydney, N.S.W., Australia

Willem Elders State University of Utrecht, Utrecht, Holland
Axel Helmer Syenskt Music History Archives, Stockholm, Sweden

John M. Jennings University of Canterbury, Christchurch, New Zealand University of Copenhagen, Copenhagen, Denmark

Susette Clausing University of Erlangen-Nuremberg, Erlangen, Germany

Anne-Marie Riessauw University of Ghent, Ghent, Belgium

Warwick A. Edwards
Georg Borchardt
Anthony Ford
University of Glasgow, Glasgow, Scotland
University of Hamburg, Hamburg, Germany
University of Hull, Hull, Yorkshire, England

G. R. Rastall University of Leeds, Leeds, England

Anne-Marie Bragard University of Liège, Liège, Belgium

Andrej Rijavec University of Ljubljana, Ljubljana, Yugoslavia lan D. Bent University of London, London, England

Ladislav Řezníček University of Oslo, Oslo, Norway

Eric Gräbner University of Southampton, Southampton, England

Giorgio Pestelli University of Turin, Turin, Italy
Walter Pass University of Vienna, Vienna, Austria
Hans Conradin University of Zurich, Zurich, Switzerland

Whenever possible, communications to the corresponding editors should be addressed care of the music department of the institution in question. Otherwise, they may be sent to the Editor of *Current Musicology* for forwarding.

PUBLISHED THE AEGIS OF COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY
New York

contents

		REPORTS
		From the Domestic Corresponding
		Editors:
	9	A Survey of the Relationship between
	3	Musicology and Performance in the
		Music Departments of Thirty-Nine
		North American Graduate Schools
Dan Broucek and	45	Chapel Hill: The AMS/SEM Meetings
Julia Ann Griffin		of 1971
RICHARD TARUSKIN	47	Lincoln Center: The International Jos-
		quin Festival-Conference, 21-25 June
		1971
		From the Foreign Corresponding
		Editors:
RICHARD RASTALL	65	Leeds: Music Studies at the University
JOHN M. JENNINGS	70	New Zealand: New Zealand Music
o o		Research
	77	Announcements
		ARTICLES
		The Spheres of Music: Harmony
		and Discord, Part I
Léonie Rosenstiel	81	Introduction and Overview
Donna K. Anderson	84	Musicians
Wulf Arlt	88	Musicology and the Practice of Music:
		Thoughts from the Work of the Schola
		Cantorum Basiliensis
Isabelle Cazeaux	95	Musicology and Other Friendly Musical
		Disciplines

Hubert Doris	100	Music-ology
PETER PAUL FUCHS	104	Interrelations between Musicology and
		Musical Performance
Fabio González-Zuleta	111	Ethnology and Music: A Philosophical
		Consideration
Anthony Hedges	116	On the Training of Musicologists and
	110	Performers in Great Britain
Dina Koston	121	Musicology and Performance: The
DINA ROSION	141	Common Ground
G	104	Commission of Commission
Siegfried Landau	124	Do the Findings of Musicology Help the
		Performer?
François Lesure	128	Toward a Committed Musicology
Meredith Ellis Little	131	What Questions Should a Performer
		Ask a Musicologist?
DAVID LOEB	138	The Composer as Musicologist
YEHUDI MENUHIN	142	Musicology vs. Performance
Anthony Newman	145	The 20th-Century Performer as Inter-
		preter of the Baroque Tradition
Michael Rabin	155	A Performer's Perspective
DENIS STEVENS	159	Some Observations on Performance
DENIS STEVENS	133	Practice Practice
Rosalyn Tureck	164	Toward a Unity of Performance and
ROSALYN TURECK	104	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	150	Musicology
	173	Contributors

Current Musicology dedicates this issue to the memory of

WILLIAM J. MITCHELL (1906–1971)

under whose chairmanship and through whose inspiration this journal came into existence.

Columbia University: A.B., 1930

M.A., 1938

Assistant Professor, 1941-1947 Associate Professor, 1947-1952

Professor, 1952-1969

Chairman, Department of Music, 1962-1968

State University of New York at Binghamton: Professor, 1969-1971