

dissertations

Thomas Carl Slattery—*The Wind Music of Percy Aldridge Grainger*

Ann Arbor: University Microfilms (UM order no. 67-9104, 1967.
265 pp., The University of Iowa diss.)

David S. Josephson

[*Ed. Note:* This is the second in a series of writings conceived by Prof. Josephson as an essay in bibliography, seeking to provide the foundation for a thorough and broadly-based study of the life and music of Percy Grainger. The first essay, "Percy Grainger: *Country Gardens* and Other Curses," can be found in *Current Musicology* 15 (1973): 56-63.]

Percy Grainger composed and arranged music for winds from virtually the beginning to the end of his creative life. The fruits of these labors are the subject, at first glance, of the dissertation under review. In fact, however, Thomas Slattery's thesis is more than a study of the wind music: in both scope and length it is the first major attempt to deal with Grainger's life and work. The wind music provides an apt vehicle, for its remarkable range of idiom, genre, and intention allows us to explore the gamut of Grainger's productive life from almost every angle; the finest exemplars of this repertory reveal most immediately his striking ear and fastidious craftsmanship. Indeed, Grainger's largest essay for winds, *Lincolnshire Posy*, is a handbook of band orchestration and arguably the most idiomatic and sensitive composition ever written for large wind ensemble.

The table of contents reveals both the scale of Dr. Slattery's investigation and its cogent organization. The six chapters include an extended bibliographical summary; music for wind band; the chamber music for, with, and arranged for winds; Grainger's wind scoring; his innovations; and a summary of sources. Three appendices—a catalogue of selected works, the locations of autograph manuscripts, and a list of Grainger's recordings—and a bibliography conclude the dissertation. Musical examples and illustrative and analytical tables are numerous. The presence of broadly chosen source materials, the long list of acknowledgments, and quotations from Grainger's writings give evidence of the wide ground covered.

Pioneering and admirable in its breadth, the dissertation is nevertheless deeply flawed and terribly uneven. It seems to have gone wrong at its very inception, for Dr. Slattery failed to select an angle from which to approach his subject. Instead, he attempted an account of Grainger's personal and creative life, an exposition of his works for winds, a bibliographical study,

a *catalogue raisonné* of his music, an analysis of the influences upon the composer and of his influence upon others, and an interpretation of his far-flung theories. Overwhelmed by this material, Dr. Slattery has ended up with a collection of myriad bits and pieces, strung together in a random manner that gives the appearance of authority and scholarship but the substance of neither. Furthermore, the writing is unrelievedly gray, effectively stripping the composer of his crazy-quilt, contradictory, and vibrant character. Still, the size of this work places it apart from the rest of the Grainger bibliography, and close examination of it yields much of value.

Dr. Slattery states in his preface that he set out to "survey certain facets" of Grainger's creative life and to "examine in detail" the wind music, as well as to give "more than a cursory examination of [Grainger's] life as a composer and performer" (p. v). For this task he had "unlimited access" to the composer's manuscripts and private papers (p. iii). The "Bibliographical Summary" occupies fully one-third of the body of the text, and related information springs up throughout the manuscript. In effect, Dr. Slattery seems to have presented his summary as an outline for a projected comprehensive biography, and as an outline it is defective and misleading. He notes the two facets of the composer, "his private life and his public image," yet does not attempt to reconcile them or to examine their influences upon the music. The various streams of Grainger's life did issue forth, however, from one source; unless we recognize this fact, nothing will fall into place in a psychologically credible way. True, we must impose certain restrictions for the moment. Some personal material remains too sensitive for public dissemination; it must await the passage of time and present circumstance. Still, much can be discussed, for the problem at hand is not so much to unearth as to illuminate, penetrate, balance, and understand. Even the briefest exposure to Grainger's writings impresses us with the fact that he was far more alive to the wellsprings of his own character than are those who have known and written about him.

The first task is to establish the facts of Grainger's life. Dr. Slattery's occasional reliance on inadequate secondary sources and on some of Grainger's later statements tends to unbalance the biography and lead him astray. On the most elementary level he lacks familiarity with the published material. For example, discussing Grainger's experiments and innovations, he quotes the following passage from a recent article by Herbert Fred:

[Grainger] was not an evolving artist, but one who branched out more than actually grew. One cannot listen to his works and reflect, "This is of his late period, and that is of his early period."¹

But this nugget of good sense does not originate in Fred's dismal little essay. It was taken almost bodily, and without acknowledgment, from a statement made fifty years earlier, while Grainger was in his thirties and might have been thought still capable of musical growth; its insight could have come only from Cyril Scott.²

Or take the vital moment when Grainger left Australia with his mother, Rose, in order to begin serious musical study in Frankfurt am Main. Secondary sources offer more confusion than aid in ascertaining even the approximate date of his arrival. Dr. Slattery properly rejects (p. 7) the date of 1892 given by Percy Scholes³ and Thomas Armstrong,⁴ and that of 1894 given by Nathan Broder⁵ and Nicholas Slonimsky.⁶ He also rejects Grainger's own date of 1895, given in a letter written in 1958. In that note Grainger mentioned that he had gone to Frankfurt to study with Clara Schumann but that she had died a few weeks after his arrival. Since Mme. Schumann died on 20 May 1896 (as the author notes on the basis of the little entry in the *New College Encyclopedia of Music!*), Grainger must have arrived in Frankfurt in the spring of that year. He recalls that the young pianist's farewell concert had taken place on 14 May 1895 and wonders how to account for the gap of a year's time; but he sees no way to reconcile the problem. Now it is certainly possible that an old man's memory will play tricks on him, and in any case Grainger was no stickler for trifles such as childhood dates; in another late letter he wrote that he had arrived in Frankfurt *after* Mme. Schumann's death!⁷ But the date 1895 given in the 1958 letter is correct. In the introduction to the volume of *Photos of Rose Grainger*, printed privately thirty-five years earlier, Grainger dates his departure for Germany as "Middle of 1895," and his arrival in Frankfurt as "Summer 1895."⁸ An early letter from his father⁹ corroborates this date. Written on 13 November 1895, it acknowledges Percy's letters from Frankfurt and ends with "Remember me kindly to your Master & thank him for me," indicating that Grainger had already enrolled at the Hoch Conservatory there. The sequence of events now becomes clear: Grainger left Australia soon after his farewell concert in May 1895, arrived in Germany and settled in Frankfurt during the summer, and enrolled at the Conservatory that fall.¹⁰ As for the plan to study with Clara Schumann, that must have been a hope of Rose Grainger's rather than a firm arrangement; prospective students of the great lady had first to spend a year of training with one of her daughters, after which she would take on a small number of the most promising.¹¹ But from the moment the Graingers set foot in Frankfurt, they must have known that even this possibility was beyond reach, for by 1895 Mme. Schumann's health was failing rapidly. She was losing her hearing and her strength, practicing became increasingly difficult, and playing virtually impossible.¹² By the time Grainger enrolled, she was in no condition to continue with her old students, much less accept new ones. For the little boy from Australia, then, she was in effect "dead." The confusion in the letters of his old age recalls the psychological, if not the actual, truth of this dimly-remembered incident.

Sins of commission and omission mar Dr. Slattery's text so often as to throw doubts on its general reliability. Grainger did not "incorporate portions of Rarotongan part-songs in a composition called *Random Round*" (p. 164). He stated quite clearly in an article which the author has apparently misread that he incorporated the principles and techniques of Rarotongan

music, not the music itself¹³; and an examination of this work bears out that fact. The last major published composition was not the 1940 *Lincolnshire Posy* (p. 26) but *The Power of Rome and the Christian Heart* (completed in 1948, published in 1953). Grainger's interest in old music was first stimulated not by a recording prepared in 1932 by Dom Anselm Hughes (p. 41), but by the concerts of the Haslemere Festival, organized by Arnold Dolmetsch, which he had attended the previous July. No doubt Hughes played a major role in exposing Grainger to the riches of earlier ages. In fact, much of the credit Dr. Slattery bestows on Grainger for the *English Gothic Music* edition—calling it “perhaps the finest example of Grainger's editorial practices” (p. 41)—must be transferred to Hughes, as a careful reading of that edition makes evident. Conversely, the author fails to deal adequately with Grainger's enormous editorial accomplishments with both the Lincolnshire folk-songs and the Grieg Piano Concerto.

Equally troublesome are a number of misleading statements. It is insufficient to note that “many of Grainger's published compositions are notated with two dates, indicating the length of time between their conception and their completion” (p. 12n). For some works the second date indicates revision of a completed score, while for others Grainger gives three or more dates.¹⁴ The rescoring of certain compositions often stemmed not from a change in intention but merely from a desire to enhance the possibility of its commercial success and to broaden its availability to various amateur ensembles. The procedural simplification worked out in the revised “set” version of *Random Round* arose from Grainger's recognition that the piece in its original form remained beyond the scope of most musicians, even thirty years after its creation. One might add here that the composer's lifelong habit of tinkering with earlier works has left us with an immense and confusing pile of material in sketch, manuscript, and print. Its sorting, dating, and analysis are fundamental tasks which, to my knowledge, no one has begun.

Similarly inadequate is the treatment of Grainger's Anglicisms. True, as Dr. Slattery states, he attempted to avoid foreign words and expressions and preferred to use slangy words and phrases, such as “hold till blown,” “bumpingly,” and “slow off lots.” But he went further (as one of the author's illustrations shows); his literary output is dense with the products of his desire to avoid compound words having ambiguous roots or Latin origins: exhaust becomes “forspend,” museum becomes “past-hoard-house,” composer becomes “tone-wright,” etc. It was hopeless, of course. Although he kept at it for fifty years, virtually every one of these concoctions had to be followed by its common equivalent in brackets. Dr. Slattery makes no attempt to understand the reasons behind this peculiar obsession. Cyril Scott did try, in his previously cited essay,¹⁵ noting ironically that although Grainger used English words because he thought Italian impractical, the opposite held instead—he had to use Italian to explain the colloquial English. The composer had other reasons besides the supposed impracticality of a

foreign tongue; these had to do with his notions of “musical democracy.” One must also examine his practice in the broader context of the movement for language reform which held sway during the early years of this century.

Finally, in conjunction with the biography, one regrets that Dr. Slattery did not make more use of primary sources. True, the inclusion of several interesting documents (among them, the manuscript notes concerning *Hill Song No. 1*, one of the late “Round-Robin Letters,” and various recital programs) gives evidence of his having visited the Grainger collections in this country. But their presence seems the result of random pickings governed by no clear program of research. *Photos of Rose Grainger* he describes as three short accounts of her life, accompanied by numerous photographs and reproductions of her handwriting (p. 36). One would never gather from this description that the accounts *are* the reproductions; we must assume therefore that Dr. Slattery neglected to examine this vital little volume. Nor could he have read the major autobiographical efforts and come up with so little. Those documents brim over with reminiscences, facts, stories, and auto-analyses. They and the letters are essential to the most elementary study of the man and his music, and it is appalling that they remain unexplored and untapped.

* * * * *

The discussion of the music suffers from a similarly haphazard approach. First of all there is the matter of classification. Dr. Slattery states that there are “two sides” to the musician Grainger, as evinced in his “light, ‘tuneful,’ folk-oriented pieces” on the one hand, and his “experiments in electronic music” on the other (p. v). But that is a misreading of the evidence: the division, as his thesis goes on to demonstrate, is that of folk-oriented as against original music. (In fact, Grainger’s interest in mechanical and electronic music lies entirely outside the scope of this dissertation.) But this too is a difficult division to maintain, as Dr. Slattery realized in categorizing the folk-song-based *Lincolnshire Posy*, correctly, as an original work—as opposed (he claims) to “true” folk settings. The problem is that there is no such thing as a “true” folk setting, only a “true” folk song. Any setting, even the barest harmonization, alters the original, and no hard and fast relationship exists between the complexity of the alteration and its distance from the original. Indeed, Grainger felt that the ambitious *Posy* lay close in spirit to folk song, while his simpler popular settings were corruptions of it.

Within the category of folk settings, therefore, a subdivision into two types seems necessary, whether we call them serious and commercial, or complex and simple. That at least corresponds, we might note, to Grainger’s own differentiation of “genuine folksong” and “half-breed tunes . . . on the borderline between folksong and unfolkish ‘popular song.’”¹⁶ Only in this way can we truly deal with such fascinating works as the *Posy*, “*The Duke of Marlborough*” *Fanfare* for brass ensemble, the orchestral *Danish Folk Music Suite*, the sea chanty *Shallow Brown*, and the *Scotch Strathspey and Reel*, and

properly measure the chasm that separates them from *Country Gardens* and the *Irish Tune from County Derry*.

A similar distinction must be made among the original works. One cannot lump together, say, such "popular" pieces as *Colonial Song* and "*The Gum-suckers*" *March*, whose intention was nationalistic, with the strange, mock-Oriental *Arrival Platform Humlet*. One cannot label some compositions simply as experimental and the rest as "tuneful." *The Power of Rome and the Christian Heart*, for one, is neither of these, but instead serious, ambitious, and conservative in idiom. Even the lighter works, when examined as a group, seem uneasy bedfellows. They range broadly in the source of their style and in technique and structure. Where, for instance, do we place the *Children's March*, whose simple tune and jaunty swing belie elegant, even "serious" form? To lump them together is to miss half the point and thereby to diminish Grainger.

That is exactly what happens when Dr. Slattery overlooks the crucial influence of the London music hall. Grainger insisted throughout his life that he was a "musical democrat," and his ears remained open to every kind of music, whatever its source. The legendary Harry Lauder, whose voice and style so captivated George Bernard Shaw¹⁷ and his colleagues, constituted one such source.¹⁸ To ignore the music hall is simply to invite confusion. Thus the author, faced with the tunefulness of *Mock Morris* and misled perhaps by its title, mentions that work among the folk-song settings (p. 94). But Grainger himself denied any direct association:

No folk-music tune-stuffs at all are used herein. The rhythmic cast of the piece is Morris-like, but neither the build of the tunes nor the general lay-out of the form keeps to the Morris dance shape.¹⁹

Mock Morris is an entirely original work in pure music-hall style. The tune

came to me in bed, the morning after seeing "The Arcadians" (George Grossmith as the lean miserable looking jockey . . .) & based upon the motto of the song (but not its music) sung by Grossmith: "I've got a mother, always merry & bright."²⁰

Nor is *Mock Morris* unique. *Handel in the Strand*, a reworking of material for an intended set of variations on *The Harmonious Blacksmith*, is entitled "Clog Dance." The second movement of "*In a Nutshell*" *Suite*, "Gay but Wistful," was described by Grainger as

an attempt to write an air with a "Music Hall" flavor embodying that London blend of gaiety with wistfulness so familiar in the performances of George Grossmith, Jr., and other vaudeville artists. The musical material, composed in London, dates from about 1912, and was worked out and scored during the winter of 1915/16 in New York City and in railway trains.²¹

The matter of classification is admittedly perplexing. In an essay limited

strictly to the wind music, one might perhaps distinguish those compositions intended specifically for winds (*Lincolnshire Posy*, *The Lads of Wamphray*, *Children's March*, the wind-accompanied choral songs) from those that were conceived with a variety of sonorities in mind (*The Immovable Do*) or gradually evolved into wind works (*The Power of Rome*), and from the outright transcriptions (*Mock Morris*, *Irish Tune*, *Shepherd's Hey*). But whatever one's method, it must proceed from an overriding view of the music and with a clear statement of intention. Otherwise, the definitions and procedures of classification become arbitrary, and the treatment of individual works unbalanced. So it is in the dissertation at hand: Dr. Slattery's choice of extended treatment of some works and dismissal of others seems guided neither by the intention to analyze closely a major work within each category nor by the desire to give weight in accordance with the accomplishment, individuality, length, or complexity of a given work. Quite reasonably, the *Posy* receives twenty-five pages of discussion, the two *Hill Songs* fifteen, and the woodwind quintet (*Walking Tune*) six. On the other hand, however, Grainger's grandest single statement for concert band, *The Power of Rome*, is given only one page, as are the marvelous *Children's March* and "*The Duke of Marlborough*" *Fanfare*. Oddly, too, *My Robin is to the Greenwood Gone* receives extended treatment, even though it is not strictly a wind piece, while the superbly scored choral songs with wind accompaniment receive only passing mention.

Dr. Slattery's descriptions and analyses of individual works evince considerable thought, and some of them prove most convincing. His structural and harmonic analyses of the six movements of *Lincolnshire Posy* are excellent. Each movement, he notes, is built on an accompaniment-variation principle, with the folk song on which it is based functioning as a recurring cantus firmus. The construction of each movement and the nature of its accompaniment are derived with uncanny sensitivity from the characteristic shape of the original song and from the personality and vocal style of its singer. Quite properly, then, the author opens his discussion with expositions of the tunes themselves and then analyzes the form of each movement and its outstanding traits. His fine work in delineating the part-writing and penetrating the often complex harmonic patterns would have been aided by presentation of musical examples in full score rather than in photocopies of the lamentable compressed published score. One may question his attributions of Grainger's tonal idiom: there is no need to repeat, in connection with the composer's "obsession with intervals," Harold Bauer's dubious remark²² that Grainger made "exhaustive studies . . . regarding the analogy between the triad and the Trinity" (p. 68); and it is a gross simplification to state that the composer's "parallel chromaticism and chromatic root movements reflect the influence of Debussy" (p. 69). But these are minor matters when weighed against the achievement. Dr. Slattery's interest in structural, melodic, contrapuntal, and harmonic elements likewise illuminates his discussions of *Walking Tune*, which he observes is unique among

Grainger's compositions in its proximity to sonata principle (p. 102), and the *Hill Songs*, where he buttresses his arguments with splendid quotations and cogent musical examples.

Other factors, however, less susceptible perhaps to straightforward analysis, often give a work its characteristic shape and sound. Phrasing, for one, should not have been ignored, for it is an integral component of Grainger's fascination with irregular meters and rhythms. It is responsible in part for the sense of space achieved in *The Power of Rome* and for the delightful surprises of the *Children's March*. An extraordinary sensitivity to the phrasing and the general temporal quality of folksong—and to the intimate relationship between these and melodic contour, ornamentation, and harmonic rhythm—lies behind the thrust of the two-piano piece *Let's Dance Gay in Green Meadow* and is responsible for the magical contrast between the third and fourth movements of the *Posy*. On the other hand, it is the lack of interesting phrasing which so contributes to the dearth of forward motion and to the monotony (perhaps consciously sought here) in *Walking Tune* and *The Immovable Do*.

There are other ways to examine a composition, of course. Sometimes a brief incisive description will do, such as Dr. Slattery's observation that the distinctive quality of *Shepherd's Hey* is achieved by the successive use of varied instrumental groupings to suggest dancers entering and leaving the dance, and by the timbres of fixed-pitch percussion instruments (p. 91). But some works guard their secrets more closely and must be exposed to sustained scholarly work. Here the author's failure is telling. To read that *The Power of Rome* is characterized by parallel triads and chords built on fourths and fifths, and that its "overall structure [is] . . . a series of brief loosely-connected sections" (pp. 65–66) is to learn virtually nothing of that strange work. Yet it is, after all, Grainger's longest uninterrupted utterance for wind band, one on which he worked for thirty years, and his last major published composition. It is a perplexing work with a fascinating history, and any study, much less a dissertation, of Grainger's wind music must at least try to treat it seriously.

* * * * *

In the remaining chapters of his thesis, Dr. Slattery reaches beyond the wind music in several directions. The fourth chapter, on Grainger's scoring practices, includes pertinent and well-illustrated passages on the composer's use of woodwinds and pitched percussion instruments in families, and of brass primarily as solo or supporting instruments; on his characteristic combinations and juxtapositions of instrumental choirs; on his predilection for double reeds and saxophones; and on his unusual concern for the variety, weight, and disposition of his percussion instruments. Concerning Grainger's practice of setting out his music for "elastic scoring," Dr. Slattery arbitrarily rejects Charles Hughes's argument that the roots of the practice lay in contemporary theater scoring²³ and relates it instead to 18th-century string

scoring (quoting Adam Carse) and even farther back to the 16th century (citing Willaert, for no reason that I can divine other than that Grainger transcribed a single motet, *O Salutaris Hostia*, by that composer). His argument must be rejected: Grainger's "elastic scoring" dates from early in his career, after his exposure to the music hall, while his acquaintance with the work of Carse and with music from before Bach's time arose only from his contact with Dolmetsch in the early 1930's.

The fifth chapter, on Grainger's innovations, is decidedly a mixed bag, more valuable for its pulling together of disparate published material than for its original contribution. The passage on guitar tuning comes straight from Cecil Forsyth²⁴ and should have been acknowledged as such. The discussion of Grainger's Anglicisms is, as noted earlier, inadequate. The treatment of "Free Music" offers valuable primary material but relies heavily on Richard Franko Goldman.²⁵

Towards the end of the fifth chapter, Dr. Slattery cites a note in which Grainger claims seven procedures as "complete innovations at the time that *Hill Song Nr 1* was conceived & scored" (1901–02): wide-toned scales, irregular rhythms, discordant triads, triads in conjunct motion, nonrepetition of thematic material, nonarchitectural formal procedures, and large chamber music. The author's comments on these claims will not do. To assert that Grainger's use of triads in conjunct motion was based on his study of organum in the 1930's is to ignore any number of works composed far earlier—to pick two at random from the four-hand piano repertory, *Let's Dance Gay in Green Meadow* (a Faeroe Island dance setting first sketched in 1905) and *Hermundur Illi* (sketched in 1911 and published in 1924 as the first of *Two Musical Relics of my Mother*). To find in the large chamber music "a beginning of twentieth century neo-classicism" (p. 167) is to have looked for the wrong source. Dr. Slattery correctly rejects Grainger's claim to the innovation of "wide toned" (i.e., nondiatonic and nonchromatic) scales but then goes on to cite, as an earlier instance of this practice, the wrong example: Glinka's overture to *Russlan and Ludmilla*. He refers here, I believe, to the descending whole-tone scale just before the coda of the overture; but that brief passage is merely tonal coloration in a thoroughly diatonic work, whereas Grainger was talking about a fundamentally new mode of composition. Concerning the composer's early experiments in irregular rhythm, it is of little use to regret that he did not attempt "further development and refinement of these experiments" (p. 166). One may well ask whether the fifth movement of *Lincolnshire Posy* is not one such refinement, or perhaps hold that these early interests in flexible motion and accent were an important step in the more radical development towards the elimination of rhythm and meter in the "Free Music."

The first of the three appendices, "A Catalogue of Selected Compositions," requires some comment. Ten of the thirteen groupings of compositions into which it is divided are classifications devised by Grainger: *American Folk Settings*, *Barrack Room Ballads* (Kipling), *British Folk Music Settings*, *Danish*

Folk Music Settings, the *Dolmetsch Collection of English Consorts*, *English Gothic Music*, *Free Settings of Favorite Melodies*, the *Kipling Settings*, *Old English Popular Music*, and the *Sea Chanty Settings*. (Inexplicably, the *Room-Music Tit-Bits* series is omitted.) The listings under each classification are virtually complete, rather than restricted to only music with winds. They are the only comprehensive source of this material now available.

The three remaining classifications are devised by Dr. Slattery. The first of these lists Grainger's arrangements of music (including his own) for brass choir, clarinets, saxophones, and wind choir. The second is a catalogue of chamber music with winds; to it should be added the *Echo-Song Trials* of 1945 (New York Public Library MS.), a version of the *Scotch Strathspey and Reel* for piano, flute, oboe, clarinet, bass clarinet, and bassoon (National Library of Scotland MS.), and a version of *Jerusalem Shoemaker* for piano, flute, trumpet, violin, viola, cello, and double bass (Library of Congress MS.). The third classification is subdivided into arrangements for band, works for brass band, choral compositions accompanied by brass or wind band, and folk-song settings. This list is, however, curiously incomplete. Among the arrangements for band omitted by Dr. Slattery are *The Nightingale and The Two Sisters* (*Danish Folk Music Settings*, No. 10)²⁶, *Spoon River*, Katharine Parker's *Down Longford Way* (arranged for winds or band),²⁷ *Colonial Song*, *Harvest Hymn*, and *Immovable Do*. One might note here that three of the four brass-band works, three of the eight wind-accompanied choral works, and five of the six folk-song settings are arrangements in the versions listed—the brass works, in fact, were arranged not by Grainger but by Denis Wright. Finally, since the author has neglected to include in the wind-band classification a subheading for original band works, nowhere in his catalogue can one find *Children's March*, *The Lads of Wamphray*, or *The Power of Rome and the Christian Heart*.

If one can question Dr. Slattery's method of classification—and it does seem responsible at least in part for the difficulties encountered here—it is quite another matter to suggest a better method off the cuff. I have offered a few suggestions above, but the entire problem must be thought out afresh after a comprehensive listing has been made of all Grainger's music: sketches and completed works, both in manuscript and in print. For whatever method is finally settled upon, it must grow from and reflect the nature and variety of Grainger's entire output. To amass and annotate the list of that output is a dizzying prospect. The root of the problem lies in Grainger's habits not only of returning again and again to earlier works but also of setting them to "elastic scoring"—two practices that have left us with a bewildering number of versions for the majority of his compositions.

Take, for instance, a work that Dr. Slattery does not mention but which can be considered "wind music" in one of its guises: *The Lonely Desert-Man Sees the Tents of the Happy Tribes* (*Room-Music Tit-Bits*, No. 7) was sketched in 1911 and again in 1914 and was completed in 1949. It was published, probably in the following year, by Schirmer, in a reproduction of the com-

poser's manuscript. According to a card-catalogue entry at the Music Division of the New York Public Library, it was written for three voices (STB)—or three winds, or alto saxophones—accompanied by room-music (two guitars, one or two wooden marimbas, piano, and optional winds and strings) or by chamber orchestra or piano! The NYPL copy contains the score, piano conductor, and thirteen instrumental parts, and includes a typewritten "list of possible combinations." To think of the number of classifications under which this composition could be placed, and to remember that this piece is not at all unusual in the variety of its possible settings—it is, in fact, less problematic than some other works—is to gain some idea of the challenge of dealing with Grainger's music as a body.

* * * * *

Dr. Slattery divides his bibliography of printed materials into listings of books, articles from reference works and collections, and articles from periodicals. It is an indispensable tool for the Grainger student, but once again its value is diminished by an unfortunate number of errors and omissions,²⁸ and by a lack of annotation throughout.²⁹ Copies with a few additional entries penciled in by Dr. Slattery are available from the Grainger Library Society (Stewart Manville, Librarian, 7 Cromwell Place, White Plains, New York). The following entries, noted in accordance with the author's three-fold classification and including material published since his dissertation was written, should be added to his revised list:

A. Books

- Grainger, Percy. *Music, a Commonsense View of all Types*. [Melbourne:] Australian Broadcasting Commission, 1934.
- . *Photos of Rose Grainger and of 3 Short Accounts of her Life by Herself, in her own Handwriting*. . . [New York?:] Privately printed, ca. 1923.
- O'Shaughnessy, Patrick, compiler. *Twenty-One Lincolnshire Folk-Songs, from the MS. Collection of Percy Grainger*. London: Oxford University Press, 1968.
- Scott, Cyril. *Bone of Contention*. London: The Aquarian Press, 1969.

B. Articles from Reference Works and Collections

- Pears, Peter. Articles in the printed program-books of the Aldeburgh Festivals of 1966 (pp. 19–21) and 1970 (pp. 77–78).

C. Articles from Periodicals

- Dean-Smith, Margaret. "Letters to Lucy Broadwood." *Journal of the English Folk Dance and Song Society* 9 (1960–64): 233–68. Among the letters are two from Percy and one from Rose Grainger to Miss Broadwood, along with one letter and an extract of another from Grieg to Grainger.

- Dorum, Ivor. "Grainger's 'Free Music.'" *Studies in Music* 2 (1968): 86–97.
- Grainger, Percy. "Edvard Grieg: A Tribute." *Musical Times* 98 (1957): 482–83.
- . [Four Lincolnshire Folksongs.] *Journal of the Folk-Song Society* 2 (1905–06): 79–81.
- . "Is Music Universal?" *The New York Times*, 2 July 1933, sec. 9, p. 4, and 9 July 1933, sec. 10, p. 4.
- . "Mrs. Burlin's Study of Negro Folk-Music." *The New York Times*, 14 April 1918, sec. 6, p. 164.
- . "Reaching Your Goal at the Keyboard." *The Etude* 59 (1941): 79–80, 134.
- Howes, Frank and Peter Kennedy. "Obituary: Percy Grainger." *Journal of the English Folk Dance and Song Society* 9 (1960–64): 113–14. With an extract of a late letter from Grainger to Kennedy.
- Orga, Ates. "Percy Grainger, 1882–1961." *Music and Musicians* 18 (March 1970): 28–32, 34, 36, 70. With a score of *A Song of Autumn*, pp. 38–40.
- Palmer, Christopher. "Delius and Percy Grainger." *Music & Letters* 52 (1971): 418–25.
- Parker, D. C. "The Art of Percy Grainger." *Monthly Musical Record* 45 (1915): 252–53.
- . "Grainger's 'Colonial Song.'" *Musical Standard* 9 (1917): 297.
- "Percy Grainger, a Much-Needed Musical Puck." *The New York Times*, 19 December 1915, sec. 4, p. 15. Interview.
- "Percy Grainger Speaks of Value of the Organ as a Background Instrument." *Diapason* 44 (1 February 1953): 10.
- Scott, Cyril. "Die 'Frankfurter Gruppe.'" *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* 119. (1958): 81–83.
- Wells-Harrison, W. "Some Notable British Music. 8. Percy Aldridge Grainger. British Folk-Music Settings." *Musical Standard* 8 (1916): 190–91.
- Willetts, Pamela. "An Autograph Manuscript of Percy Grainger." *The British Museum Quarterly* 25 (1962): 18–19.

References to several other brief articles and to obituaries on Grainger can be found in *The Music Index* (1949–). Of especial interest is a recently published issue of *Recorded Sound* (the journal of the British Institute of Recorded Sound, nos. 45–46 [January–April 1972]). It contains notable essays on the "Free Music" by Grainger and by his associate in that project, Burnett Cross, as well as invaluable discographies by Eric Hughes ("The Recorded Works of Percy Grainger"), A. F. R. Lawrence ("Records of Percy Grainger as an Interpreter"), and Gerald Stonehill ("Piano Rolls Played by Percy Grainger"). Also to be found in this issue is a slightly abbreviated version of a doctoral thesis on the "Free Music" by Margaret Hee-Leng Tan, which will be discussed in the third part of this essay.

NOTES

¹ "Percy Grainger's Music for Wind Band," *Journal of Band Research* 1 (Autumn 1964): 16.

² "Percy Grainger: The Music and the Man," *The Musical Quarterly* 2 (1916): 427-28. See this reviewer's article in *Current Musicology* 15 (1973): 60-61.

³ *Oxford Companion to Music*, 9th ed. (London: Oxford University Press, 1955), p. 420.

⁴ "The Frankfort Group," *Proceedings of the Royal Musical Association* 85 (1958-59): 4.

⁵ *Die Musik in Geschichte und Gegenwart*, vol. 5 (Kassel and Basel: Bärenreiter, 1956), col. 673.

⁶ *Baker's Biographical Dictionary of Musicians*, 5th ed. (New York: G. Schirmer, 1958), p. 599.

⁷ He was, on the other hand, quite exact in his dating of compositions, to the day and often to the place. Thus, in the MS. copy of *Random Round* of 1943 (not, as Dr. Slattery states, 1945), one follows Grainger through the score of the "random" version from Utah through Idaho and Wyoming to Denver from 23 to 28 February; the "set" version was written out in Springfield, Missouri, on 14-15 March 1943.

⁸ Page 3.

⁹ Original at the Grainger Museum in Melbourne; photostatic copy at the Library of Congress.

¹⁰ The MS. sketches for *The Life of my Mother & her Son*, written after the composer's mother committed suicide in 1922, date his period of study in Frankfurt from September 1895 to March 1900 (p. 16).

¹¹ Eleanor Sternberg, "Clara Schumann: Woman and Artist" (M.A. thesis, Columbia University, 1969), pp. 60-61.

¹² Berthold Litzmann, *Clara Schumann: An Artist's Life Based on Material Found in Diaries and Letters*, vol. 2, trans. Grace Hadow (London: Macmillan & Co., 1913), pp. 430-37.

¹³ "Collecting with the Phonograph," *Journal of the Folk-Song Society* 3 (1908-09): 147-242.

¹⁴ Thus, *I'm Seventeen Come Sunday* was composed in 1905 and rescored in 1912, while the second Kipling setting, *We Have Fed Our Seas for a Thousand Years*, was begun in 1900, completed in 1904, and rescored in 1911.

¹⁵ See note 2 above.

¹⁶ "Program-Note," *Lincolnshire Posy* (New York: G. Schirmer, 1940), [p. 2].

¹⁷ *How to Become a Musical Critic*, ed. Dan Laurence (New York: Hill & Wang, 1961), p. 322.

¹⁸ *Photos of Rose Grainger*, p. 4. Grainger mentioned hearing Lauder several times between 1909 and 1914.

¹⁹ Prefatory note to the score.

²⁰ MS. sketches for *The Life of my Mother & her Son*, p. 40.

²¹ Prefatory note to the score.

²² *Harold Bauer, His Book* (New York: W. W. Norton & Co., 1948), p. 251.

²³ "Percy Grainger, Cosmopolitan Composer," *The Musical Quarterly* 23 (1937): 135. See also *Current Musicology* 15 (1973): 60.

²⁴ *Orchestration*, 2nd ed. (New York: Macmillan & Co., 1949), pp. 479ff.

²⁵ "Percy Grainger's Free Music," *The Juilliard Review* 2 (Fall 1955): 37-47. See also *Current Musicology* 15 (Spring 1973): 60.

²⁶ Published by G. Schirmer in 1931 with indications for military band.

²⁷ Published by Boosey (London) in 1936.

²⁸ Grainger's article on Grieg in *The Etude* 61 (1943) is in four parts, not one, running from June to September; Sidney Cowell's obituary note in the *Journal of the International Folk Music Council* 14 (1962) is followed by two others by Maud Karpeles and Poul Lorenzen. There are some errors in pagination. I have checked only random entries and suspect that other such lapses occur elsewhere.

²⁹ The following annotation, for one, would have pinpointed the importance of Henry Finck's monograph on Strauss: Percy Grainger, "Appreciation—Richard Strauss: Seer and Idealist," pp. xvii-xxv, etc. Slattery gives only the title, *Richard Strauss, the Man and His Works*, and the publishing information.