

# current musicology

number 75/spring 2003

FESTSCHRIFT IN HONOR OF CHRISTOPHER HATCH

Guest edited by GLENN STANLEY

- |                      |     |  |
|----------------------|-----|--|
| ERNEST H. SANDERS    | 7   | Preface  |
| CHRISTOPHER HATCH    | 11  | A Selected Bibliography  |
| LEEMAN L. PERKINS    | 15  | Concerning the Ontological Status of the Notated Work in the Fifteenth and Sixteenth Centuries |
| ERNEST H. SANDERS    | 51  | "Are My Ears on Wrong?" Hearing Polyphony of ca.1375–ca.1450                                   |
| EDMOND STRAINCHAMPS  | 79  | Five Saliences in Marco da Gagliano's Earliest Madrigals                                       |
| PETER SCHUBERT       | 91  | Recombinant Melody: Ten Things to Love About Willaert's Music                                  |
| EDWARD LIPPMANN      | 115 | Musical Articulation: A Synoptic View of Baroque Form  |
| CHRISTOPHER H. GIBBS | 117 | Writing Under the Influence? Salieri and Schubert's Early Opinion of Beethoven                 |
| JANNA K. SASLAW      | 145 | The Concept of <i>Ausweichung</i> in Music Theory, 1770–1832                                   |
| RICHARD TARUSKIN     | 165 | A Suggestive Detail in Weber's <i>Freischütz</i>   |

- DAVID W. BERNSTEIN 169 "Paths of Harmony" in the First  
Movement of Brahms's Cello  
Sonata in E minor, Op. 38
- EDMUND J. GOEHRING 185 Musical Platonism in Modern  
Culture

**BOOK REVIEWS:  
MUSIC AND POLITICS IN AFRICA**

- BRETT PYPER 205 Louise Meintjies. *Sound of Africa!  
Making Music Zulu in a South  
African Studio*
- ANDREW EISENBERG 214 Kelly Askew. *Performing the  
Nation: Swahili Music and Cultural  
Politics in Tanzania*
- MARTIN SCHERZINGER 223 Kofi Agawu. *Representing African  
Music: Postcolonial Notes, Queries,  
Positions*

**CONTRIBUTORS**

**IN THE NEXT ISSUE**

**CALL FOR PAPERS**

*Corresponding Editors*

*AUSTRALIA*

Mark Carroll University of Sydney  
Margaret J. Kartomi Monash University, Clayton  
Andrew D. McCredie Monash University, Melbourne

*BELGIUM*

Francis E. Maes State University of Ghent  
Philippe Vendrix Université de Liège

*CROATIA*

Vjera Kataliniec Croatian Academy of Arts and Sciences

*GHANA*

J. H. Kwabena Nketia International Centre for African Music & Dance

*HONG KONG*

Greta Olson Chinese University of Hong Kong

*IRELAND*

Harry White University College, Dublin

*ITALY*

Paul Terse Pontificio Istituto de Musica Sacra, Rome

*PORTUGAL*

Manual Carlos de Brito Universidade Nova de Lisboa  
Salwa El-Shawan Castelo-Branco Universidade Nova de Lisboa

*SLOVENIA*

Svanibor Petan University of Ljubijana

*SOUTH AFRICA*

Winfried Lüdemann University of Stellenbosch

*SWITZERLAND*

Laurenz Lütteken University of Zurich

*UNITED KINGDOM*

Stephen D. Banfield University of Bristol  
Barry A. R. Cooper University of Manchester  
Jonathan M. Dunsby Editor-at-Large, Reading  
David R. A. Evans University College of North Wales, Bangor  
Mark Everist University of Southampton  
Piers Hellawell Queen's University of Belfast  
Sarah S. Hill University of Southampton  
David Wyn Jones Cardiff University  
Elaine Kelly University of Edinburgh  
Nicholas Marston King's College, Cambridge University  
Gerald R. Seaman St. Antony's College, Oxford University

## *Editor's Preface*

The papers in this Festschrift honor Christopher Hatch in a way that says something crucial about the nature of his contributions to the music department of Columbia University for more than four decades. Their diversity with respect to discipline, period, and approach reflects not only the breadth of his scholarly interests but also his wide-ranging expertise. In addition to his years as editor of *The Musical Quarterly*, Chris served as mentor–editor to several generations of fellow and later students as well as professional colleagues within Columbia and in the field. He read with the greatest empathy for the values, methodologies, and writing styles of his authors. While maintaining the highest of standards, he never tried to impose his own point of view but rather succeeded in making his critique from within, thinking, as far as this is possible, with the mind and soul of the author. His success as mentor–editor depended greatly on his unwavering sympathy and respect for his students and colleagues and his unsurpassable, although reserved affability and patience. He was also a great teacher. Understated, decidedly (and no doubt purposefully) not stirring or dramatic, he was, nevertheless, an inspirational teacher whose humanism embodied the ideals of a liberal arts education to the highest, most idealistic degree. And he also educated when the talk—walking down Broadway or in Tom's Restaurant—was about municipal politics, German literature, New England Yankees and so many other topics. He was always a rare bird; it is difficult to imagine that many, if any, of his breed still survive. Ernest Sanders, who was at Columbia with Chris from the beginning, tells us more about him in his profile. I close by wishing him and Lois many years of good health and intellectual vigor. And good reading of these papers! I am sure that the contributors to this book and its readers who know and treasure him will join me.

*Glenn Stanley*  
*The University of Connecticut*

## Preface

*Ernest H. Sanders*

It is my great good fortune to have known Christopher Hatch since the fall of 1950, when both of us entered Columbia University as graduate students of historical musicology. His superior qualities became readily apparent to fellow students and faculty alike. During his entire subsequent teaching career at Columbia, Chris was sought out by students and colleagues for his perspicacious, yet always tactful instruction, comment, and advice. "He makes us think," I heard students say, as they became engaged by this gifted teacher. The combination of his musicality and keen intelligence, often laced with a fine sense of humor, has been of great benefit to all.

While his specialty became what is known as theory, his numerous writings show that the term "theory" is quite inadequate to define his interests, knowledge, and competence. Very few of his articles could be described as music-theoretical (one example being his contribution to the book edited by him and David W. Bernstein in honor of Patricia Carpenter). Most of them, as well as his numerous reviews, reveal the mind and the learning of a cultural historian of perceptive musicality, often conveying insights going well beyond the expectations generated by their titles. One of the many examples is his elegant essay on "The 'Cockney' Writers and Mozart's Operas" in *The Opera Quarterly* (1985), which gives evidence of his wide reading—referring, for instance, to a recent edition of Mary Shelley's *Frankenstein*. Six years later, on the occasion of the bicentenary of Mozart's death, the journal's editor wrote: "I take particular pleasure in making [this one] the first of the journal's original articles ever to be reprinted in the *Quarterly*" (1991:27).

His essay on Hugo Wolf's *Fussreise* (1988), in citing corroborating examples by Schumann, Henschel, Mendelssohn, and Ives, enriches the listener's experience through the investigation of the conceptual realm in which this *Lied* arose. And his *Opera Quarterly* article on "The Wondrous Trumpet Call in Beethoven's *Fidelio*" (1999)—stimulated by his review in the same journal the previous year (1998)—compellingly shows its author as a man of insightful musicality and eloquent humanity. I can think of no other contemporary writer on music whose probity and intelligence would cause him to make a contextually apt comment on "the current low respect for the holy estate of matrimony" (1999:16).

All the articles are relatively brief (averaging about 15 pages), but hardly seem so in the reading, being concentrated and, like their author, spare—*multum in parvo*. His numerous reviews evince the breadth of his interests and knowledge, attracting, informing, and persuading the reader by means not only of their multifarious competence, but also of the pithy elegance of his prose and at times by the display of his civilized good humor. The reader will often be gratified by the startling and illuminating recall of items of relevant information from areas of knowledge at times quite far removed from the topic at hand. Some reviews (e.g. 1991) attain a scope and a depth admirable vis-à-vis the books under discussion. The bibliographic care and control is consistently impressive; see, for instance, his citation of a wonderfully apt passage from Berlioz's essay on Beethoven in his review in *The Opera Quarterly* (1998) or his truly recondite mention of an unaccounted omission (2003:116, n.3).

For his colleagues—first the graduate students, later many of the faculty—he was and is an invaluable reader, whose acquaintance with a great variety of topics (musical and others) is combined with sympathetically critical insight into authors' thinking. Those are the traits that qualified him well for his editorial activities. Some of the contributors to this volume—many of them former graduate students in Columbia University's Department of Music—have communicated to me their fond insights into Chris, the man and the scholar. One describes him as a person of outstanding intelligence, knowledge, generosity, kindness, sincerity, gentlemanliness, and wit—both teacher and friend; the last three words recur in another communication. And a third writer, characterizing him as “a scholar and teacher with one of the keenest musical intellects,” refers to the “quiet and unassuming way” in which “as teacher and colleague he selflessly . . . help[ed] advance the careers of others.”

His New England background surely accounts in part for his reticence, modesty, and probity. I cannot imagine Chris hurting anyone. I do, however, remember faculty meetings, when as a departmental citizen he was clearly hurt and angered by thinking or actions inconsonant with his impeccable libertarian and moral standards. Political matters—departmental or otherwise—can occasionally ignite his eyes, glittering through the lenses of his glasses, when it is clear to him that issues or people are going indefensibly astray. Chris is someone who doesn't know how not to think right, whether professionally, politically, or in personal relations.

For a number of years he and his wife, Lois, have been living in Vermont, the home state of his forebears, where he has been devoting some of his time to floral gardening. Having admired the success of his horticultural efforts, I, jointly with my fellow contributors and the editor, dedicate this volume to Chris—truly a gentleman and a scholar—and offer admira-

tion and best wishes to our Vermont Voltaire and his wife in this year of their golden wedding anniversary.

June 22, 2003

*References*

- Hatch, Christopher. [1985] 1991. The 'Cockney' Writers and Mozart's Operas. *The Opera Quarterly* 8 (1): 27–40.
1988. Tradition and Creation: Hugo Wolf's 'Fussreise.' *College Music Symposium* 28: 70–84.
1991. Review of *The Early Romantic Era: Between Revolutions, 1789 and 1848*, edited by Alexander Ringer. *19th Century Music* 15: 80–85.
1998. Review of Paul Robinson, *Ludwig van Beethoven: "Fidelio,"* Cambridge Opera Handbook. *The Opera Quarterly* 14 (4): 121–25.
1999. The Wondrous Trumpet Call in Beethoven's *Fidelio*. *The Opera Quarterly* 15 (1): 5–17.
2003. Review of *Opera: A History in Documents*, edited by Piero Weiss. *The Opera Quarterly* 19 (1): 113–16.

