

"Structures of fantasy and fantasies of structures": Engaging the Aesthetic Self

Austin Clarkson

After completing my poems, I am curious to review them in the light of their own (at the time unconscious, or mostly unconscious) intentions, with certain unfoldings of the thirty years they seek to embody. These lines, therefore, will probably blend the weft of first purposes and speculations, with the warp of that experience afterwards, always bringing strange developments.

—Walt Whitman, *A Backward Glance o'er Travel'd Roads*

1. First Purposes

The past and present interflow as the years scroll by since the first issue of *Current Musicology* came off the press. The welcome invitation from the present editor to contribute an essay to celebrate the fortieth anniversary encourages me to knit together those beginnings with current doings. Recently I offered some fugitive thoughts on the founding of *CM* (Clarkson 2000), but here, borrowing a leaf from Walt Whitman, I shall look for the larger patterns that emerge from the warp of these days and the weft of those. To begin with, please forgive a brief memoir of my days in Dodge Hall before I explore "experience afterwards, bringing strange developments."

Born in England and raised in Canada, I was educated on the shores of Lake Ontario—a bachelor's degree in science (with music studies on the side) from the University of Toronto on the north shore, and a master's in music theory from the Eastman School at Rochester to the south. My first teaching post took me to the Canadian prairies for three years, after which I opted for a doctorate in musicology at Columbia University. I was inducted by Paul Henry Lang, Erich Hertzmann, Edward Lippman, and Denis Stevens into historical musicology, by William J. Mitchell into Schenkerian theory, by W. T. H. Jackson and Paul Oskar Kristeller into medieval and Renaissance studies, and by Robert Austerlitz into linguistics. Eventually I completed a dissertation on the poetic structure of the medieval motet—"eventually," because completion of the degree was long delayed by efforts attending the founding of *CM*, a burgeoning family, and teaching. Today I see that another factor distracted me from tending to historical studies. I had once had visions of being a composer, and for my master's thesis I chose a recent work by Stravinsky. The courses at Columbia hardly satisfied my interest in new

music, so I was intrigued when I heard from the pianist Zaidee Parkinson that she was organizing an analysis class on contemporary music with the composer Stefan Wolpe.

Stefan Wolpe! About four years before, I had been flipping through the bin of new releases in a Toronto record store, when I stopped to look at a cover with a collage of portraits of a middle-aged man dressed casually in rumpled sweater and open shirt. The four photos of different sizes, two vertical and two horizontal, captured a long, mobile face with thick eyebrows and a balding head in expressions that were variously surprised, pensive, emphatic, and laughing heartily. Composers were usually pictured in suits and ties, with serious, even severe, expressions, looking like businessmen or civil servants. Anyone who presented himself so informally and congenially must, I thought, be exceptional. The impression was confirmed when I turned the cover over and read: "Stefan Wolpe is in the words of Aaron Copland, 'One of the most remarkable of living composers . . . his music is strikingly original . . . some pounding natural force brings it forth and gives it reality . . . Wolpe is definitely someone to be discovered'" (Wolpe 1955). I took the LP home and was dumbfounded. Nothing by Bartók, Schoenberg, or Stravinsky prepared me for the wild eruptions of David Tudor playing the Passacaglia and the Violin Sonata (with Frances Magnes), or the jazz-tinged concatenations of the Quartet for Trumpet, Tenor Saxophone, Percussion, and Piano. To study with the maker of such extraordinary music seemed a rare opportunity, and I agreed to join the class.

Five of us gathered at a brownstone on Seventieth Street just west of Broadway. Wolpe greeted us warmly on the third-floor landing, and as we took our places in the living room it was like entering an ongoing seismic event. Wolpe's enthused presence and emphatic voice irradiated the room with vibrant energy. We began with the first of Schoenberg's Three Piano Pieces, Op. 11. At the start of a lesson one of us would venture comments on the assigned passage until Wolpe picked up on a suitable cue and took off. He suffused the notes on the page with ideas and images that brought them to vivid life. He revealed how the shapes and intervals, the gestures, the rate of circulation of the total chromatic, the pitch-class sets (he called them "autonomous fragments"), and so forth, were in a dialectic of becoming. Wolpe analyzed the piece as though it were emerging fresh from the composer's mind, and he taught us to connect music with painting, poetry, dance, food, and even sex. Wolpe's personality was overpowering, even intimidating, but ultimately affirming. My notions of music and of how and what to teach were utterly transformed.

Wolpe also had a hand in more personal affairs. I had just written the comprehensive exams in the fall of 1961, when he said after a lesson, "You

should get to know my friend Beverly. She's working at Columbia." Beverly Bond, with a master's in composition from Mills College and a Fulbright year in Paris, had come to New York to study with Wolpe. She had a job as secretary in the music department and was sitting behind a desk in the office, when I introduced myself. Six months later we were married. The Wolpe clan at Columbia also included Charles Wuorinen and Harvey Sollberger, who were students of Otto Luening. They founded the Group for Contemporary Music in 1962, programmed Wolpe regularly, and commissioned him to write for their concerts in McMillin Theater. And two alumni of the musicology program, Cheryl Seltzer and Joel Sachs, who founded The Performers Committee for 20th-Century Music (now Continuum) gave several Wolpe retrospectives. I was becoming better acquainted with the intense sounds, abstract shapes, and fractured continuities of Wolpe's pieces, which seemed to exist in some dimension beyond familiar musical time and space. There was no question in my mind as to his greatness, and when a particularly obtuse review by a second-string critic appeared in the *New York Herald Tribune*, I wrote a letter of protest to the editor. Professor Lang, the paper's chief music critic, remarked on my letter, seemingly amused that a Wolpe fan should be lurking among his students.

As members of the Wolpe clan we attended concerts, lectures, exhibitions, and receptions all over Manhattan. Uptown he was known as "Shtefan," in midtown as "Stefan," while downtown he was "Steve." We caught glimpses of painters Mark Rothko, Willem de Kooning, Franz Kline, and Estéban Vicente, jazz musicians Eddie Sauter and Johnny Carisi, and composers Edgard Varèse, John Cage, Morton Feldman, and Earle Brown. These occasions were intimations of another world from the stacks of Butler Library and the reading room of the Music Division of the New York Public Library (then at Forty-second Street). In that era live composers occupied a kind of *terra nullius* on the map of the known musicological world. About all we knew was "There be Dragons." A dissertation on a living composer was out of the question. It is fruitless (though tantalizing) to speculate that had I had the temerity to even contemplate a dissertation on Wolpe, fought for it and prevailed, many questions about his life and work that will now never be laid to rest might have found answers.

Wolpe asked me to prepare a lecture of his for publication in a book of writings by contemporary composers (Wolpe 1967). It was a fateful introduction to a role that occupies me to this day.¹ As I assembled a version of "Thinking Twice" from his handwritten and typed copies, I struggled to make sense of his words. The lecture begins:

No one can blur the evidence of the light's ravishing speed. No one can dissuade an apple from falling as no one has the strength to withhold his

breath. Laws of nature can't be bent into modifying the nature of laws. But one can sit out history and its yesterday's implications. Many have tried so. But having taken their judgments for granted, alas, they find themselves confronted by the turntables of history, and being like waves that try to stick to the ground, they fight, or give up, or wither away. (2002:167)

The strange syntax and the surreal images flowed together with the numerous musical examples in a kind of hyper-discourse far removed from the usual prose of composers and theorists. To render the text clearer, I regret that I persuaded Wolpe to conform a few passages to ordinary usage.² The Dutch critic Dick Leutscher notes that Wolpe's language, like that of the philosopher Ernst Bloch, has a long tradition that originated in Talmudic and Hassidic "ways of showing things by means of an anecdote, a 'Witz' with a striking metaphor. The rhetoric comes from the Bible; it is the language of the old prophets of Israel" (Leutscher 2003:137). On occasion Wolpe's points were utterly clear:

Don't get backed too much in a reality which has fashioned your senses with too many realistic claims. When art promises you this sort of reliability, this sort of prognostic security, drop that baby I will say! Good is to know not to know how much one is knowing. And all the structures of phantasy and all the phantasies of structures one should know about—and one should mix surprise and enigma, magic and shock, intelligence and abandon, Form and Antiform. (Wolpe 2002:191)

He sought to free music from the burden of history and to liberate the imagination from rampant rationalism.³ But it was the era when young music scholars were fascinated with behaviorism, structuralism, analytical philosophy, and symbolic logic. Armed with the tenets of *Kultur- und Stilgeschichte*, we sallied forth to teach students to identify snippets of music from the procession of European periods according to the gospel of Norton and to analyze style and form according to structural theory. It was difficult to cultivate "surprise and enigma, magic and shock" when there was seldom even time to cover the few twentieth-century items in the Norton reliquary. Eventually I took to traversing music history in reverse order, but it was many years before I found ways of teaching and conducting research that incorporated structures of fantasy with fantasies of structure.

We moved to New Haven in 1967 and kept in close touch with the Wolpes, as his health was declining rapidly from the effects of Parkinson's disease. I was teaching music history at Yale and completing the dissertation when the news came in 1969 that fire had ripped through the Wolpe apartment. They had just moved to Westbeth, the artists' housing cooperative in the West Village, and his papers were mercifully still packed in boxes.

After the firemen drenched everything, they threw the smoldering boxes and furnishings out of the window into the courtyard three floors below. A platoon of friends and students arrived to help with the dismal task of spreading thousands of soaked and singed sheets of paper out to dry on the still-vacant top floor of the Westbeth building. Reassembling the soiled sheets of paper into their original order fell to a few helpers, among whom Cheryl Seltzer (a classmate from Columbia and an associate editor of *CM*) played a major role.⁴ Bringing order to the catastrophic and incalculable mess went on for many years.

When Wolpe died in April of 1972 just short of his seventieth birthday, only fifteen of his songs and works for solo instruments and chamber ensemble were available in published form. He died without a will, and it was several years before the estate was settled. The Stefan Wolpe Society was incorporated in 1981 to supervise the publication of scores and recordings, at which time the Peer-Southern Organization (now Peermusic Classical) took a major interest in publishing the Wolpe catalogue. Thanks to a team of devoted editors, almost all of Wolpe's music is now available in authoritative editions. In 1993 the Paul Sacher Foundation of Basel purchased the papers from Wolpe's widow, the poet Hilda Morley. The scores, correspondence, and sundry other materials now reside in the Foundation's vaults on the Münsterplatz, high above the Rhine. There, in the company of the scores of many twentieth-century masters, the restoration of the Wolpe materials continues in expert hands.

2. On Structures of Fantasy

In 1972 I returned to Toronto to teach in the fledgling music department of York University, a newly-founded campus with a faculty of fine arts. Programs in electronic music, South Indian music, ethnomusicology, and jazz set York apart from the more traditional offerings at the neighboring University of Toronto. David Rosenboom taught composition, and when he left to become dean of the California Institute of the Arts, his place was taken by James Tenney. Between them they invited many leading avant-gardists to the campus, among them John Cage, Max Neuhaus, David Behrman, Richard Teitelbaum, Fred Rzewski, Alvin Lucier, David Tudor, and Pauline Oliveros. Biofeedback experiments and improvisations of all kinds opened up new vistas: Neuhaus's "Water Whistle" (in the campus swimming pool), Tudor's "Rainforest" (in a dining hall), and the premiere of Cage's "Essay on the Weather." As the only full time musicologist in the Wolpe circle, it had fallen to me to take a major role in dealing with his legacy. I underwent a mid-career change, and in any case there was little call for medieval

Current Musicology

and Renaissance studies on this new campus. Nevertheless, training in paleography and source studies came in handy as I set to work to decipher handwriting, match ink and paper types, and describe the Wolpe papers for an inventory.

Pauline Oliveros came to York for the summer sessions of 1973 and 1974 and I sat in on her classes. Her sonic meditations and other exercises that tapped into the creative musical imagination were liberating. Until then I had not questioned packing courses so full of concepts, facts, and skills that there was no time for evoking personal musical experience. I began to apply Pauline's ideas and found that reflective exercises provided a valuable respite from the cognitive demands of the coursework. In order to explore the role of body movement in music learning I studied Dalcroze eurhythmics and Laban analysis of movement. I also qualified to administer the Myers Briggs Type Indicator in order to enable students to identify the pattern of preferences that influence their approach to teaching and learning. Some questioned spending classroom time on such extra-curricular doings, but most seemed to benefit from an approach to learning that valued individual experience. It was on my personal journey under the care of practitioners of C. G. Jung's analytical psychology that I learned how activating the imagination releases symbolic images that are guides to the individuation process. When I was given the opportunity to design an interdisciplinary fine arts course in the school of part-time studies, I put forward a proposal for a course that would focus on the creative imagination. "Foundations of Creative Imagination" somehow survived collegial scrutiny and was accepted into the university calendar. I gathered together a team of specialists in expressive movement, visual art, voice and story-telling, and the psychology of Jung, while I took care of music and administration. We offered the two-semester course for the first time in 1984, and it was received so warmly that we gave it every year or two during the next decade.

I shall describe the course briefly, for its consequences have mushroomed to take up a major portion of my time and energies.⁵ The curriculum can be summarized in some seven concepts:

(1) Creativeness is a drive directed to the realization of the innate potential of the individual (Jung [1921] 1971).

(2) The creative imagination bridges the primary process of the unconscious and the secondary process of conscious ego awareness (Jung [1928] 1970); the threshold zone between the primary and secondary processes is variously named the "transcendent function" (Jung [1916] 1960), "aesthetic experience" (Dewey [1934] 1958), the "presentational state of awareness" (Langer 1942), the "tertiary process" (Arieti 1976), and the "flow experience" (Csikszentmihalyi 1990).

(3) Activating the creative imagination in various expressive media releases emergent symbolic images, metaphorical compounds of sense data, thoughts, feelings, memories, and intuitions (Jung [1921] 1971); such authentic formations have an adaptive, homeodynamic, and life-enhancing tendency (Stevens 1995).

(4) Discovering correspondences between emergent personal images and primordial (archetypal) images from cultures past and present, and learning the vocabulary, grammar, and effects of symbolic images develops the symbolic attitude (Whitmont 1991).

(5) The stages of the creative process—preparation, incubation, illumination, and verification (Wallas 1926)—engage the primary, secondary, and tertiary processes.

(6) The creative process is cognate in structure with the ritual process; self-created rites of passage evoke in the group a sense of “existential or spontaneous *communitas*” (Turner 1969).

(7) Personality type identifies individual preferences among the attitudes (extraversion and introversion) and the functions of perception (sensing and intuition) and evaluation (thinking and feeling) (Jung [1921] 1971); personality type indicates the individual’s approach to teaching, learning, and creativeness, and how he or she relates to individuals in the group (Myers 1980).

The experiential component involved exercises for activating the imagination in various media that gave rise to strange encounters for a university classroom. At first students treated their images as though they were signs with a defined, dictionary meaning. Instead of unpacking images at once, they learned to “backpack” and dialogue with them until significant meanings arrived, usually with a shock of recognition. In time they developed the symbolic approach, which Edward Whitmont described as mediating “an experience of something indefinable, intuitive or imaginative, or a feeling-sense of something that can be known or conveyed in no other way, since abstract terms do not suffice everywhere” (Whitmont 1991:16). The response to the course indicated that these mature students—many of whom were accomplished artists, dancers, musicians, writers, and teachers—discovered that their education had lacked something fundamental (Clarkson 2005:12). The course evoked a strong sense of community, so much so that the class of 1994–95 decided to stay together. The group continues to meet three to four times a year, has put on public shows of artwork, and has provided workshops for adults and young people.⁶ Since 2003 the artist-teachers of the group have given a program on the creative imagination to some two thousand school children. Having retired from

active teaching at the university, I now find myself working with school teachers and their students.

The theme of musicologist as educator emerges from the warp and woof of memory with startling force. While at Columbia I noted the disdain with which musicologists thought of music educators, and so as editor of *CM* I planned an issue on musicology and music education.⁷ In the editorial I critiqued the notion of music literacy, stating that “much new educational and musicological research in hearing, learning, and musical concept formation is required for an empirically well-founded program for musical literacy” (Clarkson 1966:133). Forty years on I find myself still engaged in this campaign, for the culture of testing and accountability that now dominates education across North America has put arts education in more jeopardy than ever. A report from the Council for Basic Education surveyed the effects of the “No Child Left Behind” Act of 2002. The one thousand elementary and secondary school principals from four representative states who were polled reported that while more instructional time is being spent on literacy, numeracy, and science, the overall curriculum has narrowed drastically. There is a widespread decrease in time for social studies, civics, and geography, with the largest cutbacks in the arts, especially in schools with a high-minority population. Some principals pointed out despairingly that the arts are what keep many students in school (Von Zastrow 2004).

Though the situation seems bleak, it is possible to hope that a paradigm shift may be in the wind, and that arts education may become part of a larger enterprise, namely, the education of the imagination. During the last two decades, stimulus-response behaviorism and the computational theory of mind have been replaced by the notion that thought is a flow of images, defined as patterns in any sense modality or combinations of sense modalities—vision, hearing, taste, smell, and the bodily senses (touch, muscles, temperature, pain, the viscera, and inner ear). “Thought is an acceptable word to denote such a flow of images . . . Images are the currency of our mind” (Damasio 1994:280; 1999:303–04). The reciprocal effects of mind and body are being demonstrated with functional magnetic resonance imaging. For instance, the intentional act of forming the mental image of an object with the eyes closed selectively activates the same place in the brain as seeing the object with the eyes open. It has also been shown that a receptive mental state contributes to the final perception even more powerfully than the stimulus itself. The mental and spiritual force that sustains attention in meditation and other reflective practices can produce “plastic and enduring changes in the brain and hence the mind. *Intention is made causally efficacious through attention*” (Schwartz and Begley 2002:336–37, 360, emphasis added). I should now like to report on programs that have enhanced the intent to engage in aesthetic experience by heightening the attention of the

participants. One program was for viewing a painting in a museum setting, while the other, conducted with a small group of graduate students, was for music. Both made use of exercises that were developed in the course on the creative imagination.

3. Activating the Imagination with Visual Art

While consulting on the redesign of the Canadian Historical Wing of the Art Gallery of Ontario (AGO), I proposed an exhibit that would provide several interpretive approaches to a selected painting. The plan was approved, and a booth was constructed so that two people at a time could view the painting “The Beaver Dam,” a wilderness landscape by J. E. H. MacDonald. When visitors sat in the booth and put on a headset, they selected from among three audio programs: a three-minute discussion of the painting by the curator; a three-minute description of the artist by friends and relatives; and a twelve-minute reflective program for activating the imagination.⁸ The exhibit opened in 1993 and was in operation for ten years.

At the end of the twelve-minute exercise visitors were invited to record their responses on “share-your-reaction cards” and leave them in the booth. During the decade of operation, some fifteen hundred cards with words and drawings that pertained to the painting were collected. An audience survey conducted with 198 visitors found that only two percent left cards, which suggests that tens of thousands had used the facility. The survey and the cards affirmed that an imaginative engagement with an artwork resulted in meaningful and memorable experiences for a broad range of the visitor population. Youngsters, teens, adults, and seniors from many walks of life, educational backgrounds, and nationalities said that the program showed them a fascinating method for viewing an artwork. Novice museum-goers said that the program gave them confidence in approaching an artwork, and museum professionals applauded the exhibit as a bold and important initiative. Visitors who would normally spend only a few seconds in front of a painting as they browsed through a room with many other works of art discovered that spending twelve minutes with a canvas generated a remarkable range, depth, and intensity of meanings. Heightening attention and focusing the intent to engage with the artwork intensified the energy level of the experience. There were many reports that the painting at first seemed dull and boring, but that during the exercise it came alive. One card had two diagrams, one before the exercise, with a few rays of energy between the viewer and the painting, and one after the exercise, with more direct and stronger rays. The exercise increased receptiveness and constellated a process of bonding with the artwork. Many cards said that the exercise reduced and

Current Musicology

even eliminated the distance between the viewer and the painting. One visitor wrote that the painting “became a part of me and I a part of it.” Another, “I have learned to hold the moment—enter into it—and to be with it. The distance between myself and the painting is no longer.” Another realized that, “Art is also the EXPERIENCE, giving a whole new dimension to it.” Several visitors wrote that they had forgotten that they had an imagination, or didn’t know they had one. Many cards expressed gratitude for the program, and ninety percent of the visitors surveyed recommended that similar installations be installed in the other galleries of the museum. Art students left cards with formal analyses of the painting and comments on its structural processes without indicating that the exercise had diminished their intellectual capabilities.

For John Dewey, “esthetic experience” entails a bonding of the subject with the artwork: “The unique distinguishing feature of esthetic experience is exactly the fact that no such distinction of self and object exists in it, since it is esthetic in the degree in which organism and environment cooperate to institute an experience in which the two are so fully integrated that each disappears” (Dewey [1934] 1958:249). The bond that unites viewer with artwork becomes the conduit for felt meanings and symbolic images that the viewer experiences as authentic, creative, and beneficial. Dewey described this as the outcome of a blissful, procreative union as “when varied materials of sense quality, emotion, and meaning come together in a union that marks a new birth in the world” ([1934] 1958:267). Aesthetic experience in the Deweyan sense would not call for third-party intervention were it not for the fact that the education of the imagination has been so neglected in the culture at large. The twelve-minute audio program showed that great numbers of people appreciated being shown how to have an aesthetic experience with a painting, and that such experiences could produce powerful and transformative effects. One visitor wrote: “For a few minutes I was a part of the painting. I truly experienced an epiphany. I feel wonderful.” Another: “There is power and spirit in this painting that I never even glimpsed before sitting down. Communion.” An artist sketched the scene with flowing biomorphic forms and wrote: “*Est une oeuvre spirituelle—une prière pour la nature.*” A young woman sketched herself floating nude in the pond, and wrote: “Free of pain and conflict . . . glorified with simplicity/listening to the choir of nature & dancing with my spiritual self. THIS IS FREEDOM” (Clarkson and Worts 2005:271–72).

When aesthetic experience engages the mind, body, and spirit so fully, it constellates the experience of the self as the totality of the personality. The disparate parts of the individual seem to unite in a state of plenitude and wholeness. Dewey’s new birth in the world may thus, at least in part, be

the sense that the aesthetic experience has brought into being the aesthetic self. Dewey warned that while aesthetic experience that is so solipsistic may be enjoyable and worth having, it is not “an enjoyed perception of the object” (Dewey [1934] 1958:276). But aesthetic experience once initiated cannot be regulated by the artist or the curator and must run its course. We can only assume that an artwork that was the medium for such powerful experiences will persist for a long time in the memory. This particular landscape had received scant attention in the literature, but now it has an extensive archive of interpretations from a vast array of viewers. While many of the cards contribute relatively little to the understanding of MacDonald’s “Beaver Dam,” many do provide original and insightful contributions to the painting’s reception history.⁹

4. Activating the Imagination with Music

A set of exercises for activating the imagination with music were incorporated in a project that I conducted with four graduate students. The purpose was to test a variety of means for heightening aesthetic experience in a controlled environment. Three of the four participants were trained musicians, while the fourth did not have extensive musical background. They are identified as follows: *Participant A* (female, non-musician, candidate for master’s in holistic education, Canadian-born); *Participant B* (female, singer, candidate for master’s in women’s studies and music, US-born), *Participant C* (female, zheng player, candidate for PhD in musicology, Chinese-born); *Participant D* (female, pianist, candidate for PhD in musicology, Canadian-born). Each session began with physical warm-up exercises and vocal toning, after which the participants engaged in the various exercises. A post-session interview with each participant discussed the overall effects of the program. The sessions were tape-recorded and transcribed, and the responses are excerpted in the Appendix.

The three exercises selected for this discussion were designed to stimulate the musical imagination and had been tested with many different groups prior to the project. The instructions were as non-directive as possible, so that much of the time during the exercises was spent in silence.

Exercise 1: Letter-Sounds

The exercise is in three phases.

Vocalizing. Participants voice the sounds of vowels and consonants while standing and moving about the room. While vocalizing, the participants let each letter-sound shape their bodies in spontaneous postures and gestures.

Group Improvisation. Participants improvise a vocal melody with letter-sounds. The improvisation may last ten to twelve minutes.

Letter-Sound Fantasy. Each participant selects a letter. After a brief relaxation, the participants are asked to imagine that the letter-sound is entering the body, moving, and transforming. After twelve to fifteen minutes the exercise concludes with a pre-arranged signal, such as striking a drum or gong. Participants record their experiences with crayons and paper.

*Responses to the Letter-Sound Fantasy.*¹⁰ *A* chose the letter "A," *B* chose "E," while *D* chose "O." (*C* did not do this exercise.) *A* first imagined letter-sound "A" as the sigh of pleasure of getting into a bath, which was followed by a shriek in response to a lightning strike. The lightning blew everything into fragments, cracked things open, shook things up. The "A" then became the "aha!" of a new idea, as in turning on a light bulb. The resolution or lysis of the fantasy was the image of screwing the light bulb into the earth, which brought the pleasant feeling of warring, disparate elements now working harmoniously together.

B experienced letter-sound "E" as the curved shape of the cursive letter. It became a continuous flow of energy of tiny particles or molecules of sound energy. Against this background emerged a dance of waves lapping like water and licking like fire. The interplay of the waves of fire and water continued as the sound energy renewed. The process had a surprising conclusion when, as *B* was making her drawing, the waves of "E" were so energetic that they ran off the page.

The letter "O" brought *D* memories of childhood games with a beach ball and rolling downhill inside a tire. The "Os" became tiny and entered her body, flowing through it as though in tiny droplets of sound energy. She recognized that many features of her body were in the shape of "O." The fantasy concluded with the image of being enclosed within the "O" while giving birth to the "O," an image of polarities in harmonious balance.

Exercise 2: Fantasy Journey

The exercise was adapted from one of Pauline Oliveros's sonic meditations (1971). After a relaxation for getting in touch with their breath, participants were asked to imagine leaving the room and going to some place in the country, lying down, placing an ear to the ground, and listening for sounds coming from the earth. After a while they stand, see a hill in the distance from which a sound is coming, and go toward the sound to discover the source. After twelve to fifteen minutes the exercise concludes with a pre-arranged signal, such as striking a drum or gong. Participants record their experiences using crayons and paper.

Responses. *A* and *D* went to known places, *B* went to a place that recalled her Chinese heritage, while *C* found herself in an unfamiliar scene. *A* heard

a deep hum from the earth and a bell from the hill. *B* at first heard wind chimes, then a deep sound from the tree. *C* heard tiny drops of water in the dry riverbed that became a noisy flood, and then from a sand dune she heard a voice reciting a poem that she had memorized as a child in school. *D* heard from the earth a humming sound that made her think of water flowing deep in the earth, and from the hill she heard a bell. The scenes were so fascinating and pleasurable that when the signal was given to conclude the exercise, none of them wanted to leave. *A* brought back a sense of the seawater and forest smells; *B* enjoyed being inside the tree so much that she remained inside it as she returned; *C* began to leave the scene by walking backwards, until she realized that she had to turn around and walk forwards; *D* wished to remain at the wooden chapel where the man was ringing a bell that was drawing her and all the animals together.

Exercise 3: Silent Solos-Silent Duets

This exercise was adapted from a program in transpersonal communication (Reed 1996). It consisted of two phases.

Silent Solo. Participants sit in pairs face to face, knees nearly touching. They are asked to imagine a musical solo in silence. After five or six minutes they record the experience with crayons and paper, then share with their partner.

Silent Duet. Partners resume sitting face to face and are asked to imagine a musical duet with the partner. After five or six minutes they record the experience with crayons and paper and share with the partner.¹¹ For the first time they did the exercise, *A* was partnered with *B*, and *C* with *D*.

Responses. During the Solo *A* and *B* experienced a high degree of mutuality already during the first solo. *B* (a trained vocalist) imagined that she began to sing, but then ceased singing and let the silence become the music. She felt that sound was surrounding the two of them, but not coming from either of them. *A* also ceased to imagine music and enjoyed the harmonious closeness with *B*. During the Duet *B* experienced an energy form between herself and *A* that began as a giant column of sound and became a round form of colored lights and music that combined both their sounds together. *A* sensed the combined music less vividly as a non-personal source of harmonious sound.

During the Solo *C* and *D* were amazed by the fact that they simultaneously imagined sending energy to each other, that they both were playing folk-like music on stringed instruments, and that they both were dancing. During the Duet *C* imagined that she was engaged in a lively improvisation with *D*, which became long, lyrical lines on a bowed instrument, then a vigorous dance during which she struck a timpani. *D* imagined a duet between Papagena and Papageno with lively, amusing, alternating phrases. *D*

imagined that *C* was playing long, lyrical lines on the cello while she played the piano. The slow, serious music kept interchanging with the fast, amusing Mozart. *C* and *D* were again astonished by the synchronicity of imagining an alternation of lively music with lyrical music on a stringed instrument.

The participants repeated the Silent Solos-Silent Duets exercise with different partners in subsequent sessions. Whereas the music they imagined and the nature of the interactions were markedly different each time, the participants continued to report intense mutuality and reciprocity of communication, colorful energy forms, and highly inventive musical and gestic play.

Discussion

These three exercises reduce external stimuli to a minimum.¹² This places the focus on autochthonous images and fantasy processes that provide access to the authentic musical imagination. The responses tend to follow a certain pattern. The initial images are generally more familiar, while the final images are more strange; the energy level increases; the initial opposition between images resolves into a balanced condition; the feeling tone proceeds from tension to relaxation and balance. Participant *A*'s experience with the letter "A" typifies this process. The "aah" of getting into the bath and the shriek of alarm at the lightning "AAAAH!" were polar aspects of the given letter-sound "A." The opening situation was disintegrated when the lightning broke it up. The disparate elements came together in the image of screwing a lightbulb (an image of a new idea, "aha!") into the earth. The opposed sounds for the bath and the lightning, which *A* described as a "duel to the death," resolved into the "aha!" of the new idea. The extreme tension of the opening situation had become an image of harmony between the light (bulb) and the dark (earth). The feeling tone came from realizing that opposed feeling states could coexist in harmony, and that that was OK.

D's exercise with the letter "O" resulted in an experience that was transformative. During the post-session interview *D* expanded on the experience:

It was a primal feeling of oneness. The circuitry of it makes me think of connections with the earth, the sun, time, the cycle of the seasons that keep returning. You know what, it was almost like a mode of worship. I know that sounds bizarre. It was like a ritual to the god "O," an acknowledgement that that essence exists. You know, like a shaman will take on the personality of an animal. In a sense I felt it was a ritual in which I took on that "O," and I think that's why I can't identify it as a specific emotion. It was more an experience.

Correspondences between “O” and the cycles of the cosmos brought the ego-system in touch with the plenitude of the self-system, where the self is understood as the over-arching totality of the personality. *D* added that she would like to have explored different letter-sounds in a similar way: “it would be that aha! feeling that I knew it was in me all the time, but I never acknowledged it, or had words for it.” She said that never before had she been able to connect with or express such an experience. The exercise motivated *D* to work with other letter-sounds, because she realized that they were within her, waiting to be unearthed. Allowing the imagination to play in silence awakens the recognition that a world of images residing deep in the psyche is waiting to be explored.

The Fantasy Journey exercise calls up primordial images of sound but places them within a narrative context. The exercise sets up a simple framework: go to the country, lie down on the ground, listen to sounds from the earth, see a hill from which a sound is coming, go to the hill and find out what is making the sound, and return. The earth-hill pairing evokes clusters of contrasting images for sound that seem to arise from the deepest layers of the imagination. Having given this exercise to dozens of groups, I am able to predict that the sounds from the earth will usually be deep, dull, hollow, humming, rumbling, and unvarying. The sounds of moving earth, water, and sand, vegetation (grasses and trees), insects, horses hooves, but no man-made instruments may be heard. The sounds from the hill, by contrast, will usually be bright, high, separated, variegated, and piercing, including sounds of flutes, harps, violins, wind chimes, birds, human voices, and various fantastic instruments. Flutes and harps predominate to an extraordinary extent and far exceed all other instruments combined. Around the harp-flute dyad cluster a number of qualities such that the harp is always associated with female figures and usually with the color gold, while the flute is always associated with male figures and usually with the color silver. The sound of silence is occasionally heard: “The sound was an absolutely crystal clear silence, so real it could almost be felt. It’s a very wonderful thing to know that sort of total absence of sound and to hear it as a sound itself” (Clarkson 1993:44–45).

Many fascinating narratives have come from this exercise. They proceed from the familiar to the strange and unexpected, but leave the individual with pleasurable feelings. The words “beautiful,” “heavenly,” “spiritual,” “serene,” “wonderful,” “entrancing,” “startling,” and “alluring” provide a constant refrain. The meditation puts participants in touch with a place of idyllic peace where they often experience a state of merging and being in flow with nature. Synaesthesias are commonplace, as when sounds are imagined as streams or fountains of colored lights. Some narratives convey extraordinarily powerful experiences of initiation and rebirth (Clarkson 1993:41).

The four participants reported sounds that were typical of the earth-hill dyad: deep, sustained humming sounds, wind blowing, waves crashing against the shore, a sustained clap on a tuning fork or bell (*A*); deep sound from the ground, wind chimes (*B*); tinkling drops and a rush of water, horses' hooves, a voice reciting poetry (*C*); low humming sound of water deep in the earth, church bell (*D*). Though the sounds were not unusual, the images from the narratives were unique: energies spiraling up and down between the earth and sky (*A*); jumping into and becoming one with a tree (*B*); walking to a chapel along with wild animals, drawn by the sound of a man striking a bell (*D*). *C*'s narrative was especially eventful. She found herself in a parched river valley, surrounded by high cliffs in which was carved a statue of the Buddha. The water began as droplets and became a deluge that flooded the valley and brought sounds of horses and battle. The hill was a dry sand dune beyond which was a turquoise lake, a scene that seemed to illustrate the poem that she heard declaimed on peace and fighting in a field of sand. The feeling tone at the culmination of these narratives was such that they did not wish the journey to end.

The exercise of Silent Solos-Silent Duets was adapted from a program in transpersonal communication conducted with large numbers of participants who reported imagining spiraling energy forms, heightened states of awareness, synchronous images, synaesthesias, and intense felt meanings (Reed 1996:220). This exercise impressed the participants with the intensity of the images, the frequent simultaneities, and the sheer pleasure of joyful, inventive, spontaneous play. For *A* (the only non-musician in the group) imagining music with another person took some getting used to. After she became more familiar with what was expected, she was deeply affected by the exercise. She discovered that communication was no longer a two-way engagement, but was contained within a larger, transpersonal entity, "a third thing that is really one thing."

The experiences from the exercises and the discussions produced a harvest of images that merit further study. During the post-session interviews *A* said that what impressed her most was how the duet exercise changed her idea of how to communicate. It took communication beyond "the simple exchange of words and ideas" and gave it a spiritual context. *B* said that the program had shown her "how mind, body, and spirit are blended" and had renewed the sense of the importance of experiencing the unknown. She had learned "the non-judgmental waiting for things to arise." *C* brought her drawings to the debriefing session, as she was concerned to know more about how they revealed the personal journey she had undergone during the project. She was also trying to find ways of including personal material in her doctoral studies. For *D* the program reconnected her with the musi-

cal part of herself. As a professional pianist and a candidate for the PhD she had become alienated from music. The program had enabled her to relax, to let music happen, and to discover that music was no longer an object of study but had a place as a natural part of herself. "I guess that what I can really say in summary is that I felt it was within me and music was a part of who I was, who I am."¹³ The four participants variously concluded that the program had brought the ego-system in touch with the self-system, where body, mind, and spirit interflow.

5. The Aesthetic Self

Subjectivity, whether that of the composer, the piece, the listener, or the aesthetic experience itself, has received increasing attention of late. Naomi Cumming's path-breaking book *The Sonic Self: Musical Subjectivity and Signification* (2000) opened up fresh vistas, which Jairo Moreno has broadened and deepened with a comprehensive and incisive critique (Moreno 2005). Moreno remarks on the belated arrival of musicology to the debate on subjectivity, a topic that has been current in the humanities and social sciences for several decades. He puts his finger on the paradox at the heart of such enquiries, namely, "the dual functionality of the individual as unit of lived experience (i.e., the self) and as the main category for the analysis of that experience (i.e., the subject)" (2005:285). This concern lies at the core of the empirical and pragmatic approach to aesthetic experience that I have been pursuing here. If the individual is valued as the unit of lived experience, then we must also value his or her account and analysis of that experience. This was not at all the case during the era of stimulus-response behaviorism, when self-reports of personal experiences were dismissed as "mentalistic." Data from studies that could be replicated were acceptable, but data from unique and unrepeatable personal experiences were not. And the taboo lingers on, as we found when the curators of the museum objected to the concept of the Exploring a Painting in Depth exhibit. They feared that the production of personal meanings would undermine their authority and encourage an "anything goes" approach to art (Clarkson and Worts 2005:262).

In the epigraph to this essay Walt Whitman explained that at the time he wrote *Leaves of Grass* he was to a great degree unconscious of his intentions. He went on to suppose that the word that best typified his method was "Suggestiveness:"

The reader will always have his or her part to do, just as much as I have had mine. I seek less to state or display any theme or thought, and more

to bring you, reader, into the atmosphere of the theme or thought—there to pursue your own flight. ([1888] 1945:378)

During the latter part of the nineteenth century it was widely understood that the unconscious had a part to play in the creative process. Whitman could expect his readers to understand that both the author and reader should take flight, and that while in flight unconscious processes would play a part. For Whitman the author's text and the reader's response shared a similar ontological status. Today we can say that when we are "in flight," the creative imagination brings the primary process of the unconscious in touch with the secondary process of everyday conscious awareness in the so-called "tertiary process," the site of imaginal cognition.

Cumming seeks to dissolve the dichotomy between the listening subject and the musical object and proposes that a reciprocal process of signification gives birth to what she refers to as the "sonic self" (Moreno 2005:301–02). However, as Moreno points out, Cumming focuses on the cognitive level of musical experience and does not admit a role for the imagination in the constitution of the musical subject (2005:302). As the exercises for activating the imagination have shown, the imagination has an essential role to play in affirming and even creating a sense of self. Moreover, they show that engaging the deep structure of aesthetic experience involves many sense modalities, so that what appears in consciousness to pertain to one art form or another emerges from a synaesthetic ground. To analyze such reports of aesthetic experience, whether to works of visual art, music, or any other art form, we must adopt the attitude that the symbolic images may confirm existing, known meanings, but that they may also carry some new meanings that have yet to be determined. Whereas individuals with extensive experience of the given medium will have highly differentiated responses to the artwork, so-called naive respondents may have experiences that contribute substantively not only to the reception of the artwork, but to their understanding of themselves and of aesthetic experience as such.

Moreno also takes issue with Cumming's unitary concept of the self, which he describes as "a conservative ideal of selfhood" (2005:303). The current survey of hundreds of responses to a single painting and of a handful of participants to a series of exercises with music provides evidence that activating the imagination produces an aesthetic experience that can evoke an expanded sense of self. Many reported that they experienced themselves (the subjects) and the artworks (the objects) as being incorporated in an inclusive entity. In the words of the visitor to the AGO, "Art is also the EXPERIENCE, giving a whole new dimension to it," and as Participant A said, "it became a third thing, and also just one thing." If the self is identified with the ego-system, this may be experienced as a de-centering of the self. But if

the self is regarded as the totality of the personality, this may be experienced as being in touch with body, mind, and spirit. It is unusual to invoke the notion of “spirit” in a secular, humanistic enterprise, but enough respondents refer to the outcome of the aesthetic experience as “spiritual” that we must address this as a natural result. By referring to transpersonal dimensions beyond the categories of mind and body, “spirit” suggests that the aesthetic experience has put the ego-system in touch with the ineffable totality of the self-system. The “aesthetic self” is the outcome of a dynamic creative process. It is not prescriptive, but rather refers in simple, pragmatic terms to the reciprocal engagement of the creative imagination with an artwork. When the deep structure of the creative process is engaged, the outcome will be a mutual subjectivity that enlightens and enthuses both the artwork and the respondent. When we endow the work of art with the gifts of our creative imaginations, we give birth in turn to our aesthetic selves.

Appendix

Responses

Exercise 1: Letter-Sound Fantasy

Participant A. “A” for some reason came really strongly to me . . . I started on this whole “A” polarity at top and bottom. Aaah! getting into a bath. Then all of a sudden this image of lightning came in, AAAAAAH! [*yell*] So there’s the tranquility of the bath and then all of a sudden the lightning strikes and sends these fragments all over the place. Then I thought of cracks. I went into this whole thing. Lightning hitting a crack, and an egg cracks, and when you go through the crack and there’s always something in there, or you discover something. I thought of caves, and cracks in caves, and going in there to find things. And the sense of sometimes that shaking up is good to move you into some new experience. Then I thought of aha! then a light bulb and the realization, then screwing the light bulb into the earth. Very rich! It wasn’t like this duel to the death. It was OK. This is how this part feels, and this is how this part feels, and when they work together they do this. I was exploring all the possibilities

Participant B. My vowel was “E.” The “E” I was picturing was not the straight linear “E” it was the “E” like this [*cursive*]. I was imagining things like a dance, a hand motion which was sometimes water, sort of lapping, sometimes fire, sort of licking, and sometimes dancing. Or it was sort of all three. The “E” was sort of always there, like a stream of non-interrupted “E” sound. It was more like a recognition of all the molecules in that, all the little bits, like renewing every second that sound. And that’s sort of what it was like. In this sound, that was always new. Always these lapping motions . . . It was both fire and water. They had the same kind of lapping,

licking, the same motion. I think there must be some connection between the roundness of those and the roundness of the small “E” I was imagining. They started being much smaller and kept getting bigger until they went off the page. I don’t think I’ve ever gone off the page.

Participant D. I felt like I really got to know the letter “O.” [laughs] I was on it and I was rolling over it like it was a big beach ball. Then I was inside of it, I was experiencing that. You know when you were a child and you get inside the tire, and you go to the top of the hill and you roll down, we used to do that a lot. Kind of like that . . . And this is lying on my back on the “O.” So it’s a physical experience of it. Then I realized it was getting smaller. It wasn’t just this big beach ball any more. It was getting smaller and smaller and smaller, and then it was entering me through my eyes, through my ears, through my mouth, and it was going through my body. The “O” became like my blood running through my veins very much. I could see almost droplets of “Os” everywhere, and flowing everywhere. I realized that my eyes are like “Os,” my mouth is an “O,” my head is an “O,” and various other things. [laughs] So I drew these first. And then me, this. And then I realized that I was enclosed in this “O,” and that I was kind of giving birth to this “O.” There was just lots of “Os.”

Exercise 2: Fantasy Journey

Participant A. [Went to an island off the West Coast, with forest, beach, rocks, and puddles with bugs in them. Sits on grass overlooking the ocean.] When I put my ear to the earth, I could hear a deep hum—solid, comforting, sustaining. The sounds around me were more powerful in a vibrant way—wind blowing, the water crashing against the rocks. I could feel the warmth from the sun. The vastness of the water felt different than the one coming from the earth, which was more from a place of solidness and rest. I felt everything, rather than heard it. The power and vibrancy of the outer world was different.

When I went over to the mountains, I felt an energy of sound—like a tuning fork sort of, a bell with one sustained clap. The mountain was reaching the sky, so I felt like moving in this same way—digging into the ground and reaching up. Spiraling down and up. This was different again from the earth and wind and water. Lingered a bit going back. I brought a sense of the seawater with me, and the smells of the forest. I left a part of my picture blank—to leave room for something new, a sense of discovery.

Participant B. [Went to field with one tree and grass. It was very flat. The sky was sunny with some clouds. Sat in the shade of the tree.] And I guess when you asked us to put our ear to the ground, the sound that I heard was sort of like wind chimes. But it was also reminding me of the other day I was just lying down and I started to hear this sound in my ear, which was like wind chimes, but it’s not, sort of tinkly but it’s not. I guess it’s a richer sound than the sound I normally associate with wind chimes. It’s not the

sound of ceramic cats, for example, [*laughs*] it's a much better sound than that. So that's the sound I heard.

[*The land was flat, so there was no hill. Instead she faced the tree.*] I turned around to face the tree that I had been sitting under and listened to the sound of that tree instead, which was sort of like the sound of the ground except it was much deeper. I had a sense that where it was coming from was way far below, or that the person that was listening was expanded trying to listen to that sound . . . Then when you were asking about going to see the mountain, or going closer to it, I just stepped into the tree, sort of jumped into it, and the whole time I could sort of feel the bark against the tree, even when I was underneath it. I could feel the roots and the ground and where the grass had been worn away. So I just jumped into the tree. And when you asked us to come back, I didn't jump out of the tree, I just sort of came back, sort of with the tree. So I also didn't really want to go, but came back easily enough.

Participant C. [*A scene of cliffs on both sides of a dry river bed. The day is very cloudy, cold, but not windy. There is a tall, looming, larger-than-life-size statue of the Buddha carved in the cliff and Chinese style trees with lateral branches and leaves. She walked on the riverbed, lay down, and put her ear to the earth.*] What I heard was the tinkling of tiny drops of water, but then, right away, it turned into a very big flood with water gushing towards me with sounds so loud that the ears couldn't bear. [*She saw a sand dune in the distance.*] I hear very loud resonance, like a thousand horses racing and people fighting. And I try to climb up the sand dune and reach the summit there. And over the lee of the sand dune I saw a lake in a crescent form which is turquoise in color and murky. And suddenly a very loud voice comes articulating a Chinese poem that I know, I mean long before, which says:

Nice grapes, nice wine in a jade bowl
which is so translucent that you can see through
the jade when light comes through it.
And I want to drink of it sitting on a horse playing a p'i-p'a.
And then if you see on lying and sleeping in a fighting field
all filled with sand, don't laugh.
Ask yourself a question, "How many of these people, in
historic times, will return after a battle?"

. . . I came back very quickly, but as I left, I was lingering and with my head turned back every time I made a step forward, or rather backwards to where I was. I walked backwards, looking at what I saw, and eventually there came a time that I said, "I really have to walk forward." I turned round and got back to where I am.

Participant D. [*Went to a place from childhood, sat on a favorite rock, with a brook, forest, bulrushes, swampy.*] When I put my ear to the earth, I hear a very low rumbling sound. It comes to me that it's probably the water underground and I'm hearing very, very deep in the earth. And the closer I

Current Musicology

am to the earth, the closer I am to hearing that water. And it has a very low kind of hum, which is the sound of the earth, this 'Mmmm Aahh' sound. And it's very comforting, this sound. [*Sees a small hill, not easy to get to. To reach it follows a winding path through trees, meadow, by a pond.*] What's drawing me towards this hill, I realize, is the sound of a bell. It's a church bell on the hill, and it's an old wooden building with wooden planks inside and a bell when you enter. And there's a man, and he's pulling this string of this old bell, and you can hear it echoing off into the distance. And not only is it drawing me to it, but it's drawing all the animals from all over the place to it, too. And we're all coming there to meet. And it's great. I don't want to leave. It's very nice. And it smells really good, the wood in the church and the trees and the grass . . . I came back quickly, because I didn't want to leave. So I just didn't look at anything and came back as quickly as I could.

Exercise 3: Silent Solos-Silent Duets

During the first session *A* partnered with *B* and *C* with *D*. In subsequent sessions the exercise was repeated but with different partners. Here is the discussion from the first time they did the exercise. For the Silent Solos exercise the partners had the palms of their hands touching.

Silent Solos

Participant B. [*Imagined singing a very clear and beautiful sound that became silence.*] I was noticing the quality of silence and how that was changing. And I think at one point we started breathing together, which I noticed at one point just in the way your hands were moving. A breakthrough. Then the quality of silence between us, because I do think that silence has texture and color. At the very end I felt that it wasn't me singing any longer. It was the two of us. Then there was sound around us filling the space, but still in a context of silence. Or the main thing was a sound around us that wasn't coming from either of us. It was very rich.

Participant A. I was wondering how hard it is to send music out and receive it at the same time. I was feeling like a Celtic harp and every once in a while [it] sounds my voice. At some point, when we were breathing together, I felt our hands kind of sank into each other, so the music wasn't so prominent any more, feeling the togetherness . . . It was so beautiful for me to feel our hands harmoniously touching. Harmony was happening with our hands and energy.

C and *D* both imagined playing a string instrument, producing folk-like music and dance. They both had the urge to send energy to each other. Their hands got warmer.

Participant D. I was trying to send you energy too. You were dancing. We were dancing. It was a folksong . . . not a jig, but a dance folk element to it.

Participant C. Mine was . . . a dance, very folkloric, Chinese, *fa* and *ti*, with all those vibrations of the fourth. It's amazing that I was trying to send energy to her and she was sending it to me.

Participant D. I was thinking energy to C. Energy. And then this idea of the dance came into my head.

Participant C. I am not quite sure of how you respond to my energy. The tingling. I feel the coldness of our hands but it got warmer now.

Participant D. It got warmer and warmer. It was very cold at first.

Participant C. At the last bit I was very amazed when you [AC] said to come back. We opened our eyes and smiled at each other, a recognition of communication.

Silent Duets

Participant A. It was very strange for me, because the first exercise we did, for some reason, I had very clearly had music happening inside me. But as soon as we had two doing it, it wasn't known so much, because there was a sharing thing. I would do something and you would respond with your voice. I would play something and make certain sounds in connection with what you were making. So there was this play back and forth, so it was the same as all coming from me. What I found was the fact that it just became incredibly light and energized, like I just found there was this other energy there.

Participant B. I didn't in my mind have a clear idea of what it was you were playing to me. But I knew that you would do something, and I would respond with a short vocal phrase, descending, high register. And then that went on for a little bit, and then what I felt was more sort of turbulence, more not feeling a strong connection. Eventually near the end I felt that our knees were together and there was a sound coming up from below us, coming through us like some giant column. And then I felt that right between us there was this round thing, in some ways like what we were doing. It was light made out of lights and blues and purples. It was music also, it was both of our musics together, so it wasn't one answering the other, it was both of them occurring at the same time as one. I could really feel like it was right here, like it had its space. It was a big, oval, round, egg-like kind of thing that was between us. But it wasn't anything from a particular instrument, it wasn't even necessarily a melody. I knew that both our sounds were together.

Participant A. That's sort of close to what I was feeling. It was more like this thing happening together. And it was almost like the music started to come from somewhere else, as it wasn't so much generated from me and from you but there was this sense of harmony.

Participant B. Yes. That's what I felt. It wasn't an individualist effort, it wasn't me making some sound, and me listening to you your ego-self making some sound. It was a greater thing than that.

Participant C. It was a kind of an improvisatory kind of thing, and I wait for *D* to start. She gives me a signal and I begin to respond in very short

detached phrases [*sings*] and wait for her to respond. She gives me a kind of heterophonic melody embellishment around that. The theme gets longer. I am trying to trick her. I'm going to a different mood, and give a more lyrical, long, legato type of violin-like bowed instrument this time. Long, long phrases, very expansive [*sings*], something like that, and then I wait for her to respond. She comes on again with the same light-hearted [*sings*] thing. Then I think, well it's time to do something together, and we begin to swirl around, and we dance, like a tango. Then we come together, I go around you, you go round me, turn around each other, then I want to give her kind of surprise, I hit a tympani. She responded by giving me a gong. Then I kind of feel the fun of the energy. We kind of talk and chant in musical terms. When we come to a close we recap some of those themes and make a kind of coda in musical terms.

Participant D. We were Papagena and Papageno. We were singing [*sings*] the short little . . . it was Mozart. We were doing that Mozart. It was funny and we were laughing. And I was doing a short phrase, and then you would do it, and then I would do it, and then you would do it. But this image kept coming into my mind, no that's silly, that's silly. Then in the background I saw you playing cello, this long lyrical beautiful phrase, and I was playing piano. And it was serious and beautiful. And yet we kept going back to the Mozart too. It was like the two images kept intertwining. We would go from one to the next, one to the next. And then finally we decided this is really fun. Yeah! We were playing, basically, just playing together. And then when you [AC] said come to an end, I thought how is this going to end, [*sings*] all these cadences [*sings*]. Because in *The Magic Flute* there is the xylophone.

Post-Session Interviews

Four to six weeks after the series of sessions concluded I interviewed the participants on the effects of the program. The following passages were excerpted from the transcript:

Participant A. The duets really spilled over into my everyday life. Brought an element into my life that was missing. First time, just doing my solo piece and not being really sure of the other. When we were doing the sharing part it was like something inside me kind of shifted so that I was able to still have that part of myself and send it to the other person but also be able to receive from that other person in my imagination. Just the awareness of doing a duet with somebody changed the whole communication process, because rather than my idea coming out and then their idea coming over to me, instead of having two separate things, it became a third thing, and also just one thing . . . It became a living breathing entity or something like that. I mean we created another life or another experience or another energy. That felt really tangible to me in all three experiences. This flow starts to happen, and I guess if I'm more aware of it being there, then I kind of honor the exchange a little bit more, or I can take it deeper to another level. It creates a kind of sacredness about life or about the con-

nection between people. It takes it beyond the simple exchange of words and ideas.

Participant B. It does remind me of a meditative practice. The same sort of emptiness, the same sort of non-judgemental waiting for things to arise. I see it as connected to that . . . I would say that in this work it becomes much more apparent how body, mind and spirit are blended. I don't think they exist separately. Trying to think of it, trying to talk about it means you bump into that. The other aspect is some desire to go into the unknown, to experience the unknown, which also why I call it spiritual. Going into the unknown is work. And that is what we were doing.

Participant C. [Most of the session was spent discussing her process as shown in her series of drawings. The project also raised the issue of how to incorporate personal, subjective material into her doctoral studies.] I was reviewing in a presentation [for a course] aspects of my life, my experiential encounters with a special piece of music which I feel closely connected to. I am not very convinced to relate it to my colleagues yet, but I make myself do it. That is one of the ways I am incorporating the subjective in academic writing, which I think I am doing with some success. The subjective is not being accepted in the academic world yet, but I feel I have to insist. When it came to my presentation it went well . . . The feedback from my colleagues was that they were dumbfounded. I was referring to a pair of trees growing in Beijing. Those trees were really there. I showed the class the picture. How can one differentiate between real and not real?

Participant D. I didn't know at that point what my relationship with music was, if it was as an academic studying it, or if it was as I always thought as a performer, or if it wasn't music at all, if it was something completely different, like therapy. I guess what the workshops allowed me to do was give me the time and the peace to ask these questions which I probably wouldn't have asked . . . I can't say scientifically that it made it clearer what direction I was going to take in my life, but I did feel a kind of a reconnection with the musical part of myself. I didn't feel as much as if it was me here and music over here. I felt that the music was within me. I was the music in a sense. And that the decision wasn't such a hard one, in a sense that it wasn't a decision I needed to make outside myself. The music was already there, and it was a question of just letting go, and relaxing, and letting it happen. And it didn't seem to matter then whether it was academic, or whether it was performing, or studying it through symbols or whatever. I guess that what I can really say in summary is that I felt it was within me and music was a part of who I was, who I am . . .

I didn't feel again that it was an object of study. It was just very natural. The hands on approach, the drawing, and the talking, and the singing, and the chanting, what we did. Because I was doing it with others and they were doing it, it created a sense of connection to the others. They're all humans too doing the same things, on the same journey. We come from different points, but we're exactly the same. As opposed to therapy, which is so here, it was a chance to explore bodily aspects, musical sound, auditory aspects

Current Musicology

that you don't get to do. There's a limit when you write things down, put things in words. You get to a limit where you can't go any further, and you want to, but how do you do it? This seems to help. And I guess that's why I equate it with a kind of a spiritual experience, because I don't know how else to call it, how else to characterize it.

Notes

This essay is dedicated to Beverly, companion on the way.

1. Works of Wolpe keep turning up from unexpected sources. Within the last year an article on film music from 1926, an agitprop song from the early 1930s, and a suite of dance music for two pianos from 1940 have been uncovered.
2. A new edition presents the original text with more fidelity (Wolpe 2002:167–97).
3. Leutscher had met Wolpe at Darmstadt in 1957 and understood that he was advocating a music of freedom in response to the total serialism then the vogue. He believes that Adorno developed his idea of *musique informelle* from hearing Wolpe's lectures and music (Leutscher 2003:136–37).
4. Cheryl Seltzer edited the 1967 project on "Musicology and the Musical Composition" (*Current Musicology* 5), which featured articles by Richard Crocker and Patricia Carpenter, with responses by Leo Treitler, Rudolf Arnheim, Ruth Halle Rowen, Edward T. Cone, Bernard Stambler, and David Burrows. The respondents focused on Carpenter's iconic essay, "The Musical Object."
5. For more on the curriculum, see Clarkson (2003 and 2005).
6. Twelve members of the group wrote personal accounts of their experiences of the course for a book in preparation on the curriculum.
7. The 1966 special issue (*Current Musicology* 4) has articles by Alexander Ringer, Claude Palisca, Frank d'Andrea, Barry Brook, and Rose Rosengard, and reviews of four dissertations in music education.
8. The twelve-minute program was adapted from an exercise in the Foundations of Creative Imagination course. For a description of the exercise, see Clarkson and Worts (2005:263–64).
9. An essay on the interpretation of the painting is in preparation.
10. See the Appendix for excerpts from the responses and the debriefing interviews.
11. If participants are musicians, they can bring instruments. Instead of sharing their experiences after the Silent Duet, the pairs go to practice rooms and prepare a two-minute piece from the material they imagined. After thirty minutes or so they return and perform these improvisations for the group. The performances are recorded, then played back and discussed. This version of the exercise is the basis of a research study with four professional musicians for a master's thesis in interdisciplinary studies.
12. Other exercises, such as listening to recorded music, made use of external musical stimuli.
13. D's response was cited in connection with John Cage's idea that music should provide a moment when "the multiplicity of elements which make up an individual become integrated and he is one" (Clarkson 2001:102).

References

- Arieti, Sylvano. 1976. *Creativity: The Magic Synthesis*. New York: Basic Books.
- Clarkson, Austin. 1966. Introduction: Musical Literacy and the Teaching of Music in School, College, and University. *Current Musicology* 4: 129–35.
- . 1993. Uncursing the Silence: An Exploration of Sonic Imagination. *Musicworks* 57: 38–46.
- . 2000. *Current Musicology* Now and Then. *Current Musicology* 69: 180–85.
- . 2001. The Intent of the Musical Moment: Cage and the Transpersonal. In *Writings through John Cage's Music, Poetry, and Art*, edited by David W. Bernstein and Christopher Hatch, 62–112. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press.
- . 2003. A Curriculum for the Creative Imagination. In *Creativity and Music Education*, edited by Timothy Sullivan and Lee Willingham, 52–76. Toronto: Canadian Music Educators' Association.
- . 2005. Educating the Creative Imagination: A Course Design and its Consequences. *Jung: The e-Journal of the Jungian Society for Scholarly Studies* 1(2): 1–17. <http://www.thejungiansociety.org/Jung%20Society/e-journal/Volume-1/Clarkson-2005.html>. [May 24, 2006]
- Clarkson, Austin, and Douglas Worts. 2005. The Animated Muse: An Interpretive Program for Creative Viewing. *Curator: The Museum Journal* 48 (3): 257–80.
- Csikszentmihalyi, Mihaly. 1990. *Flow: The Psychology of Optimal Experience*. New York: Harper and Row.
- Cumming, Naomi. 2000. *The Sonic Self: Musical Subjectivity and Signification*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.
- Damasio, Antonio. 1994. *Descartes' Error: Emotion, Reason, and the Human Brain*. New York: Putnam.
- . 1999. *The Feeling of What Happens: Body and Emotion in the Making of Consciousness*. New York: Harcourt.
- Dewey, John. [1934] 1958. *Art as Experience*. New York: Capricorn Books.
- Jung, C. G. [1916] 1960. The Transcendent Function. In vol. 8 of *The Collected Works of C. G. Jung*, edited by Herbert Read, Michael Fordham and Gerhard Adler, 67–91. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- . [1921] 1971. *Psychological Types*. Vol. 6 of *The Collected Works of C. G. Jung*, edited by Herbert Read, Michael Fordham and Gerhard Adler. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- . [1928] 1970. The Relations Between the Ego and the Unconscious. In vol. 7 of *The Collected Works of C.G. Jung*, edited by Herbert Read, Michael Fordham and Gerhard Adler, 123–304. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Langer, Susanne. 1942. *Philosophy in a New Key*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Leutscher, Dick. 2003. A Composer Sitting Between the Chairs: Wolpe, Cage, Adorno. In *On the Music of Stefan Wolpe: Essays and Recollections*, edited by Austin Clarkson, 133–38. Hillsdale, NY: Pendragon Press.
- Moreno, Jairo. 2005. Review Essay: Naomi Cumming, *The Sonic Self: Musical Subjectivity and Signification*, Indiana University Press, 2000, 370 pp. *Music Theory Spectrum* 27 (2): 283–307.
- Myers, Isabel Briggs. 1980. *Gifts Differing*. Palo Alto, CA: Consulting Psychologists Press.
- Oliveros, Pauline. 1971. *Sonic Meditations*. Baltimore: Smith Publications.
- Reed, Henry. 1996. Close Encounters in the Liminal Zone: Experiments in Imaginal Communication. *Journal of Analytical Psychology* 41 (1): 81–116; 41 (2): 203–26.

Current Musicology

- Schwartz, Jeffrey M. and Sharon Begley. 2002. *The Mind and the Brain: Neuroplasticity and the Power of Mental Force*. New York: Regan Books.
- Stevens, Anthony. 1995. *Private Myths: Dreams and Dreaming*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Turner, Victor. 1969. *The Ritual Process*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Von Zastrow, Claus, with Helen Janc. 2004. *Academic Atrophy: The Condition of the Liberal Arts in America's Public Schools*. Washington, DC: Council for Basic Education.
- Wallas, Graham. 1926. *The Art of Thought*. London: Jonathan Cape.
- Whitman, Walt. [1888] 1945. A Backward Glance o'er Travel'd Roads. In *The Portable Walt Whitman*, edited by Mark van Doren, 365–84. New York: Viking Press.
- Whitmont, Edward C. 1991. *The Symbolic Quest*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Wolpe, Stefan. 1967. Thinking Twice. In *Contemporary Composers on Contemporary Music*, edited by Elliott Schwartz and Barney Childs, 274–307. New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston.
- . 2002. *Das Ganze Überdenken: Vorträge über Musik, 1935–1962*, edited by Thomas Phleps. Saarbrücken: Pfau Verlag.

Discography

- Wolpe, Stefan. 1955. *Stefan Wolpe*. Esoteric LP 530, reissued as HatART CD 6182 (1996).